

1

2 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
3 FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
TEXARKANA DIVISION

4

5 THE STATE OF TEXAS :
6 Plaintiff :
7 VS. :
8 THE AMERICAN TOBACCO COMPANY; : CIVIL ACTION
9 R.J. REYNOLDS TOBACCO COMPANY; : NO. 5-96CV91
10 BROWN & WILLIAMSON TOBACCO :
11 CORPORATION; B.A.T. INDUSTRIES, : UNITED STATES JUDGE:
12 P.L.C.; PHILIP MORRIS, INC.; LIGGETT: DAVID FOLSOM
13 GROUP, INC.; LORILLARD TOBACCO :
14 COMPANY, INC.; UNITED STATES :
15 TOBACCO COMPANY; HILL & : UNITED STATES MAGIST
16 KNOWLTON, INC.; THE COUNCIL : WENDELL C. RADFOR
17 FOR TOBACCO RESEARCH-USA, INC. :
18 (Successor to Tobacco Institute :
19 Research Committee); and THE TOBACCO :
20 INSTITUTE, INC. :

4

15

16 DEPOSITION OF MICHAEL SPEER, M.D.

17 TAKEN ON SEPTEMBER 4, 1997

18

19 Called as a witness by the Defendants, taken
20 before Linda Tate, a Certified Shorthand Reporter and
21 Notary Public in and for the State of Texas, on the
22 4th day of August 1997, beginning at 8:00 a.m., at
23 Texas Children's Hospital, Room 8340, Houston, Texas,
24 pursuant to Notice and the Federal Rules of Civil
25 Procedure.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A P P E A R A N C E S

2
3 Counsel for the Plaintiff:

4 PROVOST & UMPHREY
5 490 Park St.
6 Beaumont, Texas 77704

7
8 By: MR. BRYAN O. BLEVINS, JR.

9
10 Counsel for the Defendant:

11 THOMPSON & COBURN
12 One Mercantile Center
13 Suite 3400
14 St. Louis, MO 63101

15 By: MR. MICHAEL MINTON

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It's September

3 4th, 1997. The approximate time is

4 8:10 a.m. This is the continuation of the
5 deposition from September 3rd, Dr. Speer.

6 We're on the record.

7

8 Thereupon,

9 MICHAEL SPEER, M.D.,

10 resumed the stand, having been previously

11 cautioned and sworn, was examined and

12 testified further upon his oath as follows:

13 EXAMINATION CONTINUED

14 BY MR. MINTON:

15 Q. Good morning again, Dr. Speer.

16 A. Good morning.

17 Q. Did you have a chance to review any materials

18 last night with respect to your deposition?

19 A. Are you kidding?

20 Q. No, I'm not.

21 A. No, I did not.

22 Q. Okay. Did you speak with anyone about your
23 deposition?

24 A. No.

25 Q. Dr. Speer, I would like to ask you about the

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 portion of your opinions that deals with
2 prematurity.

3 A. All right.

4 Q. The document that was provided to us,
5 Exhibit 6, that contains your opinion,
6 indicates that you have the opinion that
7 smoking is associated with premature births,
8 correct?

9 A. Correct.

10 Q. All right. And as I understand it, you've not
11 made any sort of methodologic analysis
12 regarding that association, correct?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. All right. And that opinion regarding an
15 association is based upon articles that you
16 have seen from time to time working as a
17 clinical neonatologist, correct?

18 A. And textbooks.

19 Q. And textbooks. But you -- would it be fair to
20 say that you have not done research regarding
21 the underlying study methodologies in studies
22 that have reported such an association?

23 A. I think it's stronger than an association. I
24 think it's a cause and effect relationship.

25 Q. Well, that being said, have you investigated

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 the methodology of the studies that have
2 reported --

3 A. No, I have accepted the statements of authors
4 that write in textbooks that are used in the
5 field of neonatology.

6 Q. All right. And is that true with respect to
7 the gamut of the opinions that are expressed
8 in Exhibit 6, that you've not done any
9 methodologic analysis on your own; you've
10 accepted the opinion of others?

11 A. I have not done any research in this area,
12 correct.

13 Q. All right. And so any -- any opinion that
14 you're providing us in that document is a
15 reflection of opinions of authors of other
16 documents or textbooks?

17 A. And training and articles, as you noted, that
18 I have read in the past, correct.

19 Q. With respect to the information that you have
20 become aware of regarding maternal smoking and
21 prematurity, have you seen negative studies,
22 in other words, studies that have failed to
23 report an association between maternal smoking
24 and prematurity?

25 A. Not that I can think of off the top of my

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 head.

2 Q. All right. Would those be significant to you
3 if they existed?

4 A. They might be. It depends on the methodology
5 used in the study, the size of the sample,
6 et cetera.

7 Q. All right. That is the key to any of these
8 studies, then, an analysis of the methodology?

9 A. It not so much an analysis of the
10 methodology. It is correct methods -- are
11 correct methods used in designing and carrying
12 out the study.

13 Q. All right. And if there were correctly
14 designed studies that failed to find a
15 statistically significant relationship between
16 maternal smoking and prematurity, would that
17 be of significance to you?

18 A. I think I just answered that.

19 Q. If they were large enough and well done --

20 A. And if you then took that analysis and looked
21 at all of the studies that now deal with that
22 issue, then you could probably get some sense
23 of where the preponderance of evidence is. My
24 opinion is that the preponderance of evidence
25 says that smoking and low birth weight,

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 prematurity are related.

2 Q. Okay. The -- and we covered yesterday at some
3 length the issue of causal criteria. I take
4 it that your opinion about the relationship
5 between maternal smoking and prematurity is a
6 reflection of the opinions of others regarding
7 reaching the conclusion of causation; is that
8 correct?

9 A. What I'm saying is, that smoking is a cause,
10 not the only cause by any stretch of the
11 imagination, but a cause of prematurity and
12 low birth weight.

13 Q. All right. But my question was directed more
14 towards the types of things we were discussing
15 yesterday in terms of what criteria scientists
16 use in evaluating epidemiologic studies in
17 order to make a judgment about whether a
18 statistical association demonstrated in
19 epidemiologic studies is likely to be causal.

20 Do you recall that discussion?

21 A. And I also recall telling you that I was not
22 an epidemiologist or a statistician.

23 Q. And therefore, to the extent that your opinion
24 on causation is offered here, it is offered on
25 the basis of a causal analysis done by other

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 people and not by you, correct?

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. All right. Can you tell us, Dr. Speer, in the
4 studies that did find a statistically
5 significant difference in the length of
6 gestation among mothers who smoked, what the
7 mean difference in length of gestation was?

8 A. No, I cannot remember that.

9 Q. All right. If the studies that found a change
10 in gestation length among mothers who smoke
11 compared to mothers who did not smoke was in
12 the neighborhood of three to four days, would
13 that be of clinical significance?

14 A. Can be.

15 Q. A change in gestational length of three to
16 four days can be of clinical significance?

17 A. If you happen to be on the bottom of the bell
18 shaped curve and you should have been 25 weeks
19 and you're now 24 and a half weeks, that's not
20 good.

21 Q. All right. Other than the lower left
22 asymptote of the curve, it would not be of
23 clinical significance, correct?

24 A. Depends on the patient.

25 Q. All right. If a baby --

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. If a patient, for example, is a baby of a
2 diabetic mother who is born at 34 weeks as
3 opposed to 35 weeks, there is an increased
4 risk of hyaline membrane disease in that
5 particular patient because the surfactant
6 system that governs whether a patient has
7 hyaline membrane disease, a lung disease of
8 prematurity, kicks in later in a diabetic
9 infant at -- that's born of a diabetic mother,
10 I'm sorry, not a diabetic infant -- than in
11 the normal population. So given an individual
12 patient, there can be a significant difference
13 in the need for medical support on a basis of
14 three to four days.

15 Q. All right. And I believe --

16 A. It is not an absolute.

17 Q. All right. We believe -- I believe we
18 established yesterday that in terms of viewing
19 an outcome after it has occurred in a person
20 with multiple risk factors, there is no way we
21 can go back and assign causality, total or
22 partial, to any particular risk factor,
23 correct?

24 A. As a general, global statement, I would agree
25 with you.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. All right. And with respect to the issues
2 we've discussed in this deposition, that is
3 also a true statement, is it not?

4 A. If you take the patient who already has the
5 problem and look at it post-delivery, it is
6 difficult to say what caused the problem, in
7 many instances.

8 Q. Well, I won't re-argue the point. That was a
9 response that you gave yesterday and then we
10 went on to say that in fact it was clinically
11 impossible to go back and allocate causality
12 in that patient among the various risk factors
13 that may have been present, correct?

14 A. Asked and answered.

15 Q. If -- have you -- have you reviewed any data
16 regarding mean or population-based gestational
17 age differences among mothers who smoke as
18 compared to mothers who do not smoke?

19 A. I think -- are you asking once again have I
20 done a methodological review of the
21 literature?

22 Q. No. I'm just asking if you have seen
23 gestational age data plotted out anywhere in a
24 histogram-type form comparing the smoking
25 group with the nonsmoking group?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. Probably.

2 Q. All right. And does it look like -- you
3 remember the exhibit that I attempted to draw
4 yesterday which plotted out birth weights and
5 showed two gaussian distributions, one shifted
6 left of the other?

7 A. If that was the -- if you're -- if you're
8 talking about the difference in birth weight
9 between White and Black population?

10 Q. Yes.

11 A. Yes, I remember that.

12 Q. All right. And is that the same picture that
13 you see when you compare the gestational age
14 of smokers versus nonsmokers, that you see a
15 uniformly distributed curve, one shifted to
16 the left of other, and that one that's shifted
17 left is the smoking curve?

18 A. The data that you're talking about, I have not
19 reviewed in a number of years, so I cannot
20 tell you how much that shift is.

21 Q. All right. So would it be fair to say that if
22 you don't know whether or not the length of
23 gestation is found to be uniformly shifted,
24 whether or not statistically that negates the
25 possibility that changes in mean birth weight

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 between the groups are due to extreme effects
2 in a few cases?

3 A. I think what you just said, to put it in
4 English, is that I -- if -- that there is a
5 shift in the curve because of bias of a few
6 patients. My understanding of the data is
7 that that statement is erroneous that you just
8 made and that smoking is associated
9 causally -- a cause for prematurity. Period.

10 I think that's the simplest way to look at it.

11 Q. What I was attempting to ask is: Since you
12 don't know what the nature of the shift in the
13 curve is in terms of length of gestation, can
14 you tell us whether or not the mean length of
15 gestation difference that has been found is
16 due to uniform changes among all of the point
17 constituents on the curve or among a few
18 extreme effects?

19 A. That is my understanding.

20 Q. The former or the latter?

21 A. The former.

22 Q. That there is a uniform difference among all
23 points along the curve?

24 A. There is a difference between the
25 populations. I don't know whether it's every

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 single point along the curve, but the
2 population of babies born to mothers who smoke
3 are more premature than babies born of mothers
4 who don't smoke.

5 Q. All right. But the point you just added there
6 was that is your belief or your opinion that
7 the reason that is so is not because of a few
8 extreme effects that impact that shift in the
9 mean, but because of a uniform distributed
10 change, correct?

11 A. That's my understanding.

12 Q. All right. Do you know if the Surgeon General
13 has said that maternal smoking does not appear
14 to have much effect on mean gestational age?

15 A. I don't remember that.

16 Q. All right. Is that a statement with which you
17 agree?

18 A. I'm sorry?

19 Q. That maternal smoking does not appear to have
20 much effect on mean gestational age.

21 A. I think we just spent the last ten minutes
22 getting the opinion that I have that it does
23 have an effect on gestational age.

24 Q. Well, what I'm trying to do is zero in on any
25 information you have on the change in the mean

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 value. And I -- is the answer you simply
2 don't know what the change --

3 A. No, I've already answered that question.

4 Q. All right. What is the change in the mean?

5 Is it --

6 A. I've said babies born of mothers who smoke are
7 more premature as a group than babies born of
8 mothers who don't smoke.

9 Q. Six hours more premature? Five days more
10 premature? How much?

11 A. A significantly different gestational age in
12 the two groups. Now, I've already told you, I
13 don't know exactly where the mean is and I
14 don't know exactly what the numbers are. You
15 implied four to five days and it sounded like
16 you were speaking from some knowledge that you
17 had recently reviewed. Fine. The fact of the
18 matter is, they are more premature.

19 Q. But how much more premature, you're not
20 prepared to say?

21 A. Anything that makes you more premature is not
22 a good idea.

23 Q. Well, is -- six hours isn't going to have any
24 clinical significance, is it?

25 A. I don't know.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Okay.

2 A. Depends on the baby. I imagine you could
3 probably find someone where six hours did make
4 a difference. In general, no, it doesn't make
5 a difference.

6 Q. Are you aware of any studies that have
7 associated maternal smoking with extreme
8 prematurity or very premature babies?

9 A. There may well be studies out there, but if
10 you and I both agree that all of the curves
11 are shifted, then that means that you're going
12 to shift the more premature babies and the
13 less premature babies at any given gestational
14 age.

15 Q. So that would -- that would tend --

16 A. So that would be a yes.

17 Q. Okay. What are the most prevalent
18 complications leading to preterm delivery?

19 A. I'm sorry?

20 Q. What are the most prevalent complications of
21 pregnancy leading to premature delivery?

22 A. Well, not being an obstetrician, I probably
23 can't give you as full an answer as you could
24 get from my obstetrical colleagues. I don't
25 know which is the most common cause of

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 prematurity. I can tell you there are many
2 causes of prematurity which you implied.

3 Certainly we see prematurity in
4 mothers who have undergrown fetuses that are
5 not growing in utero and it is deemed
6 important to deliver that baby in a premature
7 state as opposed to a nonpremature state for
8 the welfare of the baby and sometimes the
9 welfare of the mother.

10 Q. That would be called iatrogenic prematurity?

11 A. No, that's because you have a baby that's
12 small-for-dates in utero that's not growing
13 and you deliver them because of placental
14 insufficiency or whatever the other causes are
15 that the baby is not growing.

16 Q. All right. That -- as far as you know, that
17 particular classification is not known as
18 iatrogenic prematurity?

19 A. We many times know why the baby is small, so
20 he's not iatrogenic. We're doing it on
21 purpose.

22 Q. No, I mean -- well, I didn't mean idiopathic,
23 I meant iatrogenic.

24 A. I don't think so. I've never heard that term
25 used in that fashion.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Okay. I'm sorry. I interrupted you. You
2 were talking about other causes of
3 prematurity.

4 A. Some moms go into labor, they have incompetent
5 services and they go into labor prematurely.
6 Sometimes it is in response to medication use
7 on the part of the mother, either elicit,
8 legal or un -- or not legal.

15 Q. Okay. While we're on the topic of occult or
16 nonoccult infections, is chorioamnionitis one
17 of those nonoccult infections?

18 A. It can be occult or nonoccult.

19 Q. All right. And is that a relatively prevalent
20 condition?

21 A. By what definition do you wish to use?

22 Q. Well --

23 A. Because there are several, or at least two.

24 Q. Can you explain what the difference is between
25 the two?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. One's clinical and one's pathological, without
2 clinical findings.

3 Q. All right. Would it be fair to say that there
4 is a lot of chorioamnionitis that is missed?

5 A. Again, what definition are you wishing to
6 use? If you're using a clinical definition,
7 the answer is no. If you're using only a
8 pathologic definition that may have no
9 clinical correlate and may have no effect on
10 the baby, yes.

11 Q. All right. Is there -- is there
12 chorioamnionitis that can only be detected by
13 an inspection of the placenta?

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. And are you suggesting that if the -- if the
16 signs or symptoms of chorioamnionitis are not
17 sufficient to be clinically frank in terms of
18 being apparent without an inspection of the
19 placenta, that they are insufficient to cause
20 any form of fetal injury?

21 A. That's not what I said.

22 Q. Okay. That -- it is clear that stages of
23 chorioamnionitis that are not sufficiently
24 frank to be detected by any means other than
25 by inspection of the placenta are nonetheless

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 capable of producing fetal effects, adverse
2 fetal effects, correct?

3 A. That's a hypothesis that has not been proven.

4 Q. Is that a hypothesis that you have
5 investigated?

6 A. If by "investigated" you mean have I
7 researched -- done research in the area, no, I
8 have not done research in the area.

9 Q. I'm going to try to briefly go through a list
10 of conditions, Dr. Speer, and get your opinion
11 on whether or not these are risk factors that
12 are associated with the adverse pregnancy
13 outcomes that you have noted in Exhibit 6.

14 All right?

15 Socioeconomic studies?

16 A. For all of the issues that I raised in
17 Exhibit 6?

18 Q. Yes.

19 A. We're just sort of going to blanket say
20 socioeconomic status is responsible or has an
21 influence on all of them?

22 Q. Yes.

23 A. No, it does not have an influence on all of
24 them. It has an influence on some of them.

25 Q. All right. And which of the conditions that

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 you've identified has socioeconomic status not
2 been associated with?

3 A. I don't think there is a socioeconomic
4 status -- well, there may be in certain
5 populations. You're asking a global question
6 that's very difficult to answer without --

7 Q. Because the impact of socioeconomic status may
8 be different from population to population?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. All right. And so in order to determine the
11 effect of socioeconomic status, we have to
12 look at a particular population?

13 A. I think that would be a fair assessment.

14 Q. And if we are looking at a population of low
15 socioeconomic status, are there conditions
16 about which you have provided opinions in
17 Exhibit 6 that seem to not be associated with
18 socioeconomic status?

19 A. Again, if you -- it depends on the population
20 you're dealing with. If you're saying
21 socioeconomic status alone, there are issues
22 here, particularly those that have to do with
23 nicotine and carbon monoxide, that if you're a
24 low socioeconomic status person and don't
25 smoke, you don't have those risk factors.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 If you are a low socioeconomic
2 person who does smoke, then you have those
3 risk factors, for example. But is that due --
4 is that truly due to being low socioeconomic
5 status or is that due to other factors --

6 Q. In other words --

7 A. -- as to why they smoke?

8 Q. -- what you're saying is smoking is linked to
9 socioeconomic status?

10 A. I'm saying that although people in lower
11 educated groups of populations have a higher
12 incidence of smoking, is it truly due to their
13 socioeconomic status that they have a higher
14 incidence of smoking or is it due to some
15 other parameter such as peer pressure and has
16 nothing to do with socioeconomic status and
17 you have true, true and unrelated.

18 Q. Well, you are suggesting that smoking is
19 linked to socioeconomic status?

20 A. No, I'm suggesting that they may be two
21 independent variables and smoking occurs more
22 often in people of low socioeconomic status,
23 but it's not due to their low socioeconomic
24 status that they smoke.

25 Q. Okay. Is socioeconomic status recognized to

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 be a risk factor apart from its potential
2 confounding impact with respect to each of the
3 health effects that you've listed?

4 A. Socioeconomic status in and by itself, now,
5 does have a relationship with prematurity,
6 reduced birth weight and other morbidities
7 that are listed in Exhibit 6.

8 I am not sure -- and once again,
9 you'd have to correct now for intellectual
10 prowess in regard to the mental retardation
11 issue. Just because you are poor doesn't mean
12 you're stupid or ignorant, so far as your
13 intellectual abilities to learn.

14 However, if you are not
15 intelligent enough to learn, then certainly
16 you are mentally retarded, by definition. So
17 again, you have to be very clear in the
18 definitions to what you're trying to say.

19 Q. All right. So -- but with respect to
20 spontaneous abortions, reduced birth weight,
21 premature birth, abruptio placenta and
22 placental injury, socio --

23 A. I didn't say placental injury and I don't
24 think I said abruptio placenta.

25 Q. Okay.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. I said prematurity and low birth weight.

2 Q. How about spontaneous abortions?

3 A. I think that's true.

4 Q. All right. How about SIDS?

5 A. Once again, you have an increased risk of SIDS
6 in population groups that commonly are
7 associated with a lower socioeconomic status.

8 However, you have the information that SIDS
9 appears to be much more prevalent in certain
10 racial groups, such as American Indians or
11 Black, regardless of their socioeconomic
12 status.

13 Q. Okay. So there is an ethnic association as
14 well?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. Based on what you told us yesterday, is it
17 clear or is it true that you are unable to
18 rank socioeconomic status with respect to its
19 important as -- its importance -- I'm going to
20 start over.

21 Is it true that you're unable to
22 rank socioeconomic status as a risk factor
23 against maternal smoking in terms of its
24 relative impact in producing spontaneous
25 abortions, reduced birth weight, premature

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 births?

2 A. I'm not too sure I said that.

3 Q. All right. Are you able to --

4 A. I can't -- I would have to have the transcript

5 in front of me and refer to a particular

6 area.

7 Q. All right. Are --

8 A. I'm not too sure we've dealt with that.

9 Q. Are you able to rank the importance of

10 socioeconomic status in terms of its strength

11 as a risk factor compared to maternal smoking

12 for the production of any of the health end

13 points that you've identified in Exhibit 6?

14 A. I will state that socioeconomic status is a

15 risk factor for those items in Exhibit 6 that

16 I've identified with socioeconomic status.

17 And smoking is another risk factor for all of

18 the items that I identified in Exhibit 6.

19 Q. All right. But in terms of quantifying the

20 size or the magnitude of that risk factor,

21 socioeconomic status, and comparing it to

22 maternal smoking, you're not prepared to do

23 that?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. Is marital status a risk factor for

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 spontaneous abortions, reduced birth weight
2 and premature births?

3 A. Indirectly, in that most people who are
4 married are older than 19 as opposed to
5 unmarrieds, which are frequently teenagers,
6 and teenage age is a risk factor for
7 prematurity, low birth weight, spontaneous
8 abortions.

9 Q. And is it true, then, that being unmarried is
10 a risk factor for spontaneous abortions,
11 reduced birth weight and premature birth,
12 simply -- through the effect of age or younger
13 age, that unmarried mothers tend to be
14 younger? Is that what you were saying?

15 A. That's what I just said.

16 Q. Okay. You mentioned yesterday, and I just
17 want to make sure it embraces all three of
18 these classifications, young maternal age
19 below 19 and older maternal age above 35.

20 A. I think those are the numbers I used, yes.

21 Q. All right. Are both of those age
22 classifications risk factors for spontaneous
23 abortion, reduced birth weight and premature
24 birth?

25 A. I'm not positive regarding the risk of the

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 older patient for abortions, but I would -- I
2 think it probably very well is, because
3 chromosomal abnormalities increase with age
4 above 35 and those frequently result in
5 abortions. But certainly it is known that
6 older patients have smaller -- may have as a
7 group smaller babies and more prematures.

8 Q. And with respect to mothers who are 19 or less
9 who deliver babies, that is a risk factor for
10 spontaneous abortions, reduced birth weight
11 and premature births?

12 A. Asked and answered.

13 Q. Okay. And when you say that, you mean yes,
14 right?

15 A. No, I mean you've already asked the question
16 and I've already answered it.

17 Q. Okay. But I -- is the answer to that question
18 yes?

19 A. I've already answered that question.

20 Q. I would appreciate it if you would answer it
21 again. I'm sorry.

22 A. You've asked once again whether at age less
23 than 19 is associated with prematurity, low
24 birth weight and abruptio -- abruptios?

25 Q. Yes. No, no, spontaneous abortions, reduced

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 birth weight and premature births.

2 A. Age under 19 is associated with those three
3 entities, as I've already stated.

4 Q. All right. And is it age 19 or below or below
5 19?

6 A. Depends on how you calculate 19, probably.

7 Nineteen typically is celebrated at the end of
8 the nineteenth year. So if you say -- I don't
9 know whether the date is defined as after the
10 19th year or during the 19th year or before
11 the 19th year.

12 Q. Have you seen the literature that has
13 investigated the relationship between
14 wantedness at conception? Are you familiar
15 with that term, whether or not a baby was
16 wanted when it was conceived?

17 A. I know there are literature that deal with
18 that issue, and I'm not prepared to give an
19 opinion.

20 Q. Whether it's a risk factor for any of the
21 health effects?

22 A. I don't know.

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. That's an obstetrical question.

25 Q. Are -- is non-White race and specifically

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Black race a risk factor for each of the
2 health effects that you've listed in
3 Exhibit 6?

4 A. No.

5 Q. All right. For which is Black race not a risk
6 factor?

7 A. Well, I don't think there is any data that
8 would suggest that Blacks as a group have more
9 mental retardation than other races. I don't
10 think that Black as a single entity addresses
11 the carbon monoxide or nicotine issues. I
12 don't think that -- let's see. I'm not sure
13 about the placental injury issue.

14 MR. MINTON: Let's go off the
15 record.

16 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is
17 8:24 a.m. We're going off the record.

18 (Discussion off the record.)

19 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is
20 8:45. We're on the record.

21 Q. (By Mr. Minton) Dr. Speer, we just had a
22 brief off-the-record discussion. And what
23 I've agreed to do is to try to identify with
24 you what the health effects are that you've
25 listed in Exhibit 6 and -- so that we can put

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 them up on the board and you'll have a
2 convenient means of looking up and seeing
3 them, if you need to sort of review the list,
4 rather than trying to ask you to recall from
5 memory each time each of the health effects
6 that are listed in Exhibit 6.

7 So what I would like to do with
8 your help is to go through and get a list of
9 what has been identified in Exhibit 6. Okay?

10 A. All right. You have Exhibit 6 before you?

11 Q. I have what I think is a list. And what I
12 would like you to do is go through that with
13 me so that Mr. Blevins can then write down
14 what we agree to. Okay?

15 A. All right.

16 Q. All right. In the category adverse pregnancy
17 outcomes for the neonate --

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. -- there is listed spontaneous abortions,
20 reduced birth weight, premature births,
21 abruptio placenta and placental injury,
22 correct?

23 A. Correct.

24 Q. All right. Then in a category that deals with
25 mechanisms -- is that a fair statement --

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 the next paragraph that deals with mechanisms,
2 you talk about how the fetal effects of all
3 chemicals found in tobacco are not completely
4 known?

5 A. Correct.

6 Q. You talk about carbon monoxide binding
7 preferentially to fetal red blood cells?

8 A. In preference to oxygen.

9 Q. In preference to oxygen with accentuated
10 hypoxemia?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. You talk about nicotine acting as a potent
13 vasoconstricting agent decreasing uterine
14 blood flow?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. All right. And there is a mention made of
17 direct fetal effects of nicotine?

18 A. Because nicotine is found in higher
19 concentrations in the fetus than in the
20 mother.

21 Q. All right. And under infant complications,
22 you mention studies that show a relative risk
23 of 1.75 for mental retardation in children of
24 mothers who smoke?

25 A. Well, let's phrase it as it's written: A 75

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 percent increase in the prevalence of mental
2 retardation in the mothers who smoke.

3 Q. All right. And then you mention other studies
4 that have shown behavioral problems in
5 children of mothers who smoke raising concern
6 over neuro-developmental disorders?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. And then finally there is reference made to an
9 increased risk of SIDS in children of mothers
10 who smoke, correct?

11 A. Fourfold increase, correct.

12 Q. All right. Then finally, you discuss that
13 infants born of mothers who stop smoking
14 during the first trimester have -- and I'm
15 going to shorten this and if I shorten it
16 improperly, say so -- have pregnancy outcomes
17 that are more in line with infants of mothers
18 who didn't -- do not smoke?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. All right. And that mothers who begin smoking
21 during pregnancy have similar fetal effects to
22 those found in infants whose mothers smoked
23 throughout pregnancy?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. All right. And is that exhaustive?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. That's what's in Exhibit 6.

2 MR. BLEVINS: In fairness,
3 yesterday the doctor also identified asthma
4 or the asthma and upper respiratory
5 infection stipulation, I guess, or however
6 he phrased it. But just in fairness to
7 you, that was identified yesterday outside
8 the context of the report.

9 MR. MINTON: All right. And we
10 had a discussion about asthma yesterday as
11 well.

12 MR. BLEVINS: Yes.

13 THE WITNESS: Correct.

14 MR. MINTON: All right.

15 MR. BLEVINS: I'm not sure you
16 can read that, but at least it was a shot.

17 THE WITNESS: It's colorful.

18 Q. (By Mr. Minton) With asthma added up there --

19 A. Which really isn't part of Exhibit 6.

20 Q. All right. Is it really part of something
21 that you intend to testify about?

22 A. If asked.

23 Q. All right. But is that -- have we then gone
24 through all of the various areas about which
25 you intend to testify?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. That are in Exhibit 6, correct.

2 Q. All right. Well, is there anything else?

3 A. I don't know. People ask me questions all the
4 time.

5 Q. All right.

6 A. And it's entirely possible that you or your
7 colleagues or Mr. Blevins and his colleagues
8 will think up new and interesting questions to
9 bring to my attention that have not been
10 exhaustively dealt with yesterday and today.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. So I can't guarantee you guys.

13 Q. All right. But in terms of what you've
14 prepared yourself to testify for in connection
15 with your opinions in this case, what we've
16 just identified is it, correct?

17 A. That's not what I said. I said that if you or
18 your colleagues or Mr. Blevins and his
19 colleagues ask me other questions that have
20 not been addressed yesterday and today, I am
21 prepared to give an opinion, if I have
22 knowledge that warrants an opinion.

23 Q. But in terms of what you've been asked to do,
24 that's it, is it not?

25 A. Up to this point, yes.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Okay. No one has asked you, for instance, to
2 testify about respiratory distress syndrome,
3 correct?

4 A. As an effect of prematurity, I've already
5 given an opinion about that.

6 Q. And as I recall your opinion yesterday, you
7 don't know whether or not respiratory distress
8 syndrome is or is not associated with maternal
9 smoking, correct?

10 A. I don't think you asked that question. We
11 talked about respiratory distress syndrome as
12 being a consequence of prematurity.

13 Q. All right. Do you know whether or not studies
14 have investigated if respiratory distress
15 syndrome is associated with maternal smoking?

16 A. I am unaware of such study -- such studies.

17 Q. And therefore unaware of any association
18 positive or negative?

19 A. At the present time, correct.

20 Q. All right. Now, when we -- before we created
21 the list, you said something that you did not
22 believe that mental retardation was associated
23 with race. Did I hear that correctly?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. All right. And by that, did you mean that you

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 are unaware of any studies that have
2 identified race as a risk factor for mental
3 retardation?

4 A. No. I said that mental retardation is not
5 associated with being of a specific race --

6 Q. All right.

8 0 Is race a risk factor for mental retardation?

9 A. Based on what I just said, then, no, not as
10 a -- not as race by itself.

11 Q. All right. So you have not seen any study in
12 which race has been identified as a risk
13 factor for mental retardation?

14 A. I think you're trying -- you're twisting
15 words. Patients of given races, say American
16 Indians, have a higher incidence of alcoholism
17 and other medical problems that do result in a
18 higher incidence of mental retardation, but
19 it's not because they are American Indians.

20 So, yes, you can say that in
21 American Indians there is a higher incidence
22 of mental retardation. Studies certainly have
23 said -- made those statement. But studies
24 have not made statements, to my knowledge,
25 that race is an independent factor and causal

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 for mental retardation, whether you be Black,
2 Green or Purple.

3 Q. Okay. You just said, as I understand it,
4 alcohol consumption is a risk factor for
5 mental retardation?

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. And so in any study, we would expect to see as
8 alcohol consumption increases, the incidence
9 of mental retardation to increase, correct?

10 A. Correct.

11 Q. Race and ethnicity are associated with
12 spontaneous abortions, reduced birth weight,
13 premature births and placental injury, are
14 they not?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Is there a higher incidence?

17 A. Not by -- not because of race or ethnicity.

18 There may be other factors that cause some of
19 those problems that you enumerated, but not
20 race or ethnicity.

21 Q. All right. Is there a difference between the
22 rate of spontaneous abortions when comparing
23 White populations to Black populations?

24 A. I believe there is.

25 Q. And it's higher in Black populations, is it

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 not?

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. And when controlled for all known confounders,

4 does that higher association persist?

5 A. I don't know.

6 Q. All right. Is there a higher incidence of --

7 or prevalence of reduced birth weight among

8 Black mothers as opposed to White mothers?

9 A. We already addressed that yesterday.

10 Q. And the answer is yes, isn't it?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. All right. And does that difference persist

13 when controlled for all known confounders?

14 A. That, I believe, is a true statement.

15 Q. All right. And would it be true to say that

16 you don't know what the magnitude of the risk

17 difference is between Whites and Blacks?

18 A. I think we addressed that yesterday.

19 Q. And the answer is no, you don't, correct?

20 A. Correct.

21 Q. All right. Is -- is there a difference

22 between the incidence or prevalence of

23 premature births among Black mothers compared

24 to White mothers?

25 A. I don't know.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Is there a difference in --

2 A. And you're speaking purely on the basis of
3 race again?

4 Q. Yes.

5 A. Okay. Just wanted to make sure we're clear.

6 Q. Well, are you suggesting that you're aware of
7 data which shows that a crude odds ratio says
8 yes but then when adjusted for confounder says
9 no?

10 A. I think I may have seen data that suggests
11 that.

12 Q. Okay. Do you know where that data came from?

13 A. If I could tell you where all the data I've
14 learned over 25 years came from, I could
15 probably make a lot of money.

16 Q. Is placental injury, either in the form of
17 abruptio placenta or any other form of
18 placental injury, associated with race?

19 A. Strictly speaking, abruptio placenta is not
20 placental injury in the definition that I'm
21 using in Exhibit 6.

22 Q. All right. Then let's break it down into
23 two. Is abruptio placenta associated with
24 race, the incidence or prevalence of abruptio
25 placenta?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. Again, that's an obstetrical question. My
2 belief and knowledge is that although abruptio
3 placenta occurs more frequently in perhaps the
4 Black population, the White population, when
5 you account for age, it -- that difference may
6 well disappear.

7 Q. You specifically identified cocaine yesterday
8 as a risk factor for a variety of adverse
9 pregnancy outcomes, right?

10 A. Particularly abruptio placenta.

11 Q. Is cocaine use a risk factor for spontaneous
12 abortions?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Is cocaine use a risk factor for low birth
15 weight babies?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Is cocaine use a risk factor for premature
18 births?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. All right. Do you have knowledge of what the
21 prevalence of cocaine use during pregnancy is
22 of mothers whose -- who deliver babies and
23 whose care is paid for by Texas Medicaid?

24 A. No.

25 Q. Have you-all done surveys at any of the

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 hospitals with which you are associate --
2 associated to investigate the prevalence or
3 incidence of cocaine use among pregnant
4 mothers in any population?

5 A. Ask my obstetric colleagues. You have an
6 expert on your staff that probably could give
7 you that answer.

8 Q. All right. But you're not aware of any such
9 data?

10 A. I think there have been some surveys, but I
11 don't know the extent of them and I don't know
12 the results of them.

13 Q. All right. Are you aware of data that shows
14 that when asked, pregnant mothers
15 underrepresent their cocaine use?

16 A. They underrepresent every use of anything,
17 including cocaine.

18 Q. Is cocaine use associated with mental
19 retardation? Is maternal cocaine use
20 associated with mental retardation in a baby?

21 A. I would anticipate it probably is.

22 Q. All right. Is alcohol use associated with
23 spontaneous abortions?

24 A. Don't know.

25 Q. Reduced birth weight?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Premature births?

3 A. I believe so.

4 Q. Mental retardation?

5 A. Asked and answered. Yes.

6 Q. Other neuro-developmental disorders?

7 A. As a general catch-all, yes.

8 Q. SIDS?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. What other drugs besides cocaine and obviously
11 in your opinion maternal tobacco smoking are
12 associated with adverse pregnancy outcomes?

13 A. Alcohol.

14 Q. All right. Excluding those three, what else?

15 A. There are a variety of pharmacological agents
16 that are used to treat conditions in the
17 mother that have an association with adverse
18 fetal outcomes.

19 Q. Are there other illegal drugs or drugs of
20 abuse?

21 A. Amphetamines have been associated with an
22 untoward fetal outcome.

23 Q. Is caffeine associated with adverse pregnancy
24 outcome?

25 A. There are a number of studies debating that

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 issue. I don't think that's been finalized.

2 Q. All right. You haven't made up your mind one
3 way or the other?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. Is employment during pregnancy a risk factor
6 for adverse pregnancy outcome?

7 A. What kind of employment?

8 Q. Well, let's say that it is the type of
9 employment that is sufficient to create
10 repeated instances of fatigue.

11 A. Mental or physical --

12 Q. Physical.

13 A. -- fatigue?

14 Q. Physical.

15 A. If you're talking about being on your feet all
16 day or at a manual labor type of employment,
17 yes, that has been shown to be a risk factor
18 for prematurity.

19 Q. How about with abruptio placenta or placental
20 injury?

21 A. I don't think placental injury. Perhaps
22 abruptio. I don't know.

23 Q. How about reduced birth weight?

24 A. Don't know.

25 Q. Is education level of the mother something

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 that's been identified as a risk factor for
2 adverse pregnancy outcome?

3 A. There is an association between education and
4 socioeconomic status and adverse pregnancy
5 outcomes. But again, you must correct for
6 those persons who have lower educational
7 attainment who can't go further and those
8 persons who could. And those persons who
9 could, education by itself probably has no
10 bearing.

11 Q. And when you say "could go further," you mean
12 that they achieved a level of education
13 consistent with their abilities and were
14 unable to go further in the educational
15 system?

16 A. Because of outside influences they have no
17 control over, or they might have control over
18 but because of their peer group and other
19 factors, did not go further. But they are not
20 intellectually impaired. That group has no
21 particular reason to have children that are
22 intellectually impaired.

23 Q. All right. Well, is --

24 A. What I'm saying is, education by and to
25 itself, you know, once corrected, probably has

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 little bearing on the issue.

2 Q. All right. Is education -- has education been
3 associated with prematurity or low birth
4 weight?

5 A. Education un and to -- and by itself, acts
6 like race.

7 Q. Could you expand on that?

8 A. If you have only education as the variant and
9 you've excluded other issues such as drug
10 abuse, infections, other issues -- other items
11 that have a stronger association with adverse
12 outcome with -- and you've corrected for
13 mental abilities, then education in and by
14 itself probably has very little bearing on
15 anything.

16 Q. Is low maternal weight gain a risk factor for
17 low birth weight?

18 A. It would depend on what caused the decrease in
19 maternal weight gain.

20 Q. In other words, you've seen data which have
21 stratified causes of low maternal weight gain
22 and found some of those associated with low
23 birth weight and some not?

24 A. For example, low maternal weight gain
25 secondary is associated with the smoking of

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 cigarettes and those babies are smaller and
2 born more prematurely and have the problems
3 that we've just talked about.

4 There are some populations,
5 however, and some individuals who have no risk
6 factors except that they don't gain a lot of
7 weight. And if you took that population, I'm
8 not too sure that it has or has not shown
9 adverse outcome.

10 Q. In other words, after controlling for
11 cigarette smoking, you're not sure whether or
12 not --

13 A. Or other factors that influence maternal
14 weight gain.

15 Q. You're not sure whether the association
16 persists after you control for those factors?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. Is maternal nutrition a risk factor for
19 adverse pregnancy outcome?

20 A. Only if the mother is starving.

21 Q. And just so we've got an understanding of what
22 you mean by starving or starvation, what level
23 of nutrition?

24 A. The best studies came out of Amsterdam during
25 World War II starvation situations, and I

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 don't know -- I can't remember the exact
2 calorie intake, but I think it was less than a
3 thousand calories per day is associated with
4 the lack of fertility and a somewhat
5 diminished birth weight when the population
6 studied. I'm not too sure they looked at
7 other factors such as mental retardation and
8 others, but that data may also be out there.

9 Q. Is lack of access to or inferior quality of
10 prenatal care a risk factor for adverse
11 pregnancy outcomes?

12 A. Some people would like to say so, but there is
13 increasing data that would suggest that that
14 may not be as large a factor as we would wish.

15 Q. Are you saying that it exists as a risk factor
16 but the magnitude of the association has been
17 called into question?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. Is short interpregnancy interval a risk factor
20 for adverse pregnancy outcome?

21 A. There are some studies that I'm aware of,
22 there may be others that I'm not aware of,
23 that suggests that in some people a short
24 interpregnancy interval is associated with
25 risk of prematurity.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Would it be correct that as to all of the risk
2 factors that we've just identified, you could
3 not rate them one against the other or against
4 maternal smoking in terms of determining how
5 important they are on a population basis?

6 A. If you gave me a list of everything we've
7 talked about, I would certainly make an effort
8 to rank, but it would be difficult to in some
9 instance to -- instances to rank them as
10 opposed to other instances.

11 Q. All right.

12 A. If, for example, you asked me to rank cocaine
13 against the others for abruptio placenta, it
14 would be right up there at the top. That's
15 easy. But in other instances, it would be
16 more difficult.

17 Q. And how would you go about doing it?

18 A. If you want to read them off and give me a
19 piece of paper, I'll make an effort to rank
20 them.

21 MR. BLEVINS: I don't know that
22 I've covered all of them or not.

23 Q. (By Mr. Minton) Well, let me ask you this,
24 Dr. Speer, before we go through the exercise.
25 Would it be correct to say that you don't know

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 what the point estimates or the confidence
2 intervals for the relative risks for any of
3 those risk factors might be?

4 A. Sitting here today not having been given the
5 opportunity to investigate that, nor having
6 the opportunity to investigate that, you're
7 correct.

8 Q. All right. So any -- any ranking that you
9 give us would be a guess?

10 A. An informed guess.

11 Q. But it would not be based on data that would
12 allow you to rank relative risks, correct?

13 A. It would be data that would allow me to rank.

14 Q. All right. You would need data that would
15 allow you to rank relative risks before you
16 could go through the exercise?

17 A. No.

18 Q. All right. You would need data that would
19 allow you to see what the relative risks were
20 in order for your ranking to be scientifically
21 informed, correct?

22 A. No.

23 Q. What would be the scientific information that
24 you would rely on in order to rank them
25 without the knowledge of either the point

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 estimates or the confidence intervals for the
2 relative risks that have been described in the
3 literature?

4 A. My knowledge and training over the last 25
5 years.

6 Q. All right. And what does your knowledge and
7 training over the last 25 years tell you about
8 the relative risk of socioeconomic status for
9 the production of adverse pregnancy outcome?

10 A. Socioeconomic status in and by itself may well
11 have little bearing on pregnancy risk and
12 outcome of pregnancy, as I've already stated.

13 Q. All right. And what does "little bearing"
14 translate to in terms of an estimate of a
15 relative risk point estimate or confidence
16 interval?

17 A. Okay. You're talking about apples and
18 oranges. I'm telling you I can rank, if you
19 wish me to, the relative risk of a given
20 condition with a given outcome. You're asking
21 me confidence intervals means and relative
22 risks. That I cannot do for you because I do
23 not have the data in front of me.

24 Q. Well, do you have -- you, I think, just
25 suggested that you know what the relative

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 risk -- what is a relative risk?

2 A. A relative risk is a number, not a concept.

3 Q. All right. And you do not have any of those

4 numbers for any of the risk factors that we've

5 just identified, correct?

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. All right. And those numbers would be the

8 means by which you would rate them if you were

9 going to rate them scientifically, correct?

10 A. If I was going to rate them based on relative

11 risk, that's how I would rank them. I can

12 rank them based on concept. Alcohol is a bad

13 thing. Cocaine is a bad thing. Alcohol is

14 probably the leading cause of mental

15 retardation in this country, according to some

16 authorities.

17 So if you ask me of "X" list, is

18 alcohol high on the list for causing mental

19 retardation, the answer is obviously yes. I

20 don't need a relative risk to tell you that.

21 Now, if you want to attach a

22 relative risk, then that is the relative risk

23 of what alcohol's effect is on the issue of

24 mental retardation. Is it a cause of mental

25 retardation? Absolutely.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Dr. Speer, a relative risk is a rate in the
2 exposed -- or a ratio of rates between the
3 exposed and unexposed, correct?
4 A. The risk of a certain happening occurring due
5 to, for example, alcohol, yes. It's a number.
6 Q. Well, and do you know where that number comes
7 from, what the construct is that leads to that
8 number? If I told you that the relative --
9 A. Population studies --
10 Q. All right.
11 A. -- of patients who ingest alcohol and the
12 relative incidence of mental retardation, the
13 population study of other variables being
14 dealt with.
15 Q. And so they compare the incidence rates or
16 ratios between exposed and unexposed
17 populations, correct?
18 A. Correct.
19 Q. And determine a risk difference?
20 A. Correct.
21 Q. And that would be the means by which one would
22 rate the relative importance of different risk
23 factors, would it not?
24 A. That's the relative risk, yes.
25 Q. All right. Is there any other scientific

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 means in order to compare the relative
2 importance of risk factors?

3 A. There are other statistical methodologies that
4 are used in similar populations, but your
5 concept is correct.

6 Q. All right. And none of which you are prepared
7 to go through today for us, correct?

8 A. I am not prepared to go through numbers,
9 because I don't have the numbers in front of
10 me.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. But I know that the relative risk is higher
13 for mental retardation in populations who
14 consume alcohol when they are pregnant than
15 populations who don't consume alcohol when
16 they are pregnant. That is a statement of
17 fact.

18 Q. That is a greater than one. The relative risk
19 is greater than one, correct?

20 A. You're going to confuse the jury by your
21 relative risk of greater than one, but, yes,
22 you're correct.

23 Q. What is a relative risk of one?

24 A. There is no risk in populations; they are
25 equal.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. All right. And a relative risk of 1.1 means
2 what?

3 A. Twenty percent risk in the population is
4 exposed, higher.

5 Q. One point one means a twenty percent --

6 A. No, you said -- I thought you said 1.2. I'm
7 sorry. If you said 1.1, it's ten percent.

8 Q. And a relative risk of 2.0 means what?

9 A. Two hundred -- a hundred percent more.

10 Q. What do you believe are the constituents of
11 socioeconomic status which best describe it in
12 terms of the effects that socioeconomic status
13 has on adverse pregnancy outcome?

14 A. Not being a sociologist, I cannot answer your
15 question.

16 Q. Do low income groups usually include younger
17 and less educated women than do middle income
18 groups?

19 A. Frequently.

20 Q. Are Black patients more likely to be poorer,
21 have less education and seek prenatal care
22 later during pregnancies than White -- than
23 White patients?

24 A. In the population of the United States as a
25 whole?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Yes.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And are you familiar with any sub-populations
4 in which that is different?

5 A. I would anticipate in River Oaks there is
6 probably no difference.

7 Q. So in order to accurately characterize those
8 differences, we need to focus on a particular
9 population and its characteristics?

10 A. Not necessarily particular population. We
11 need to focus on the population as a whole,
12 not a particular population.

13 Q. I thought you just pointed out that River Oaks
14 would have different characteristics than the
15 population as a whole?

16 A. Right. That's why I said the population of a
17 whole is a better sample than restricted or
18 particular populations.

19 Q. What is the mean income in the United States?

20 A. I don't know.

21 Q. Do you expect that it would be substantially
22 different than the mean income in the Texas
23 Medicaid population?

24 A. Don't know. Not knowing the mean income of
25 the United States and not knowing the mean

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 income of the Texas Medicaid population, I
2 have no basis to make an opinion.

3 Q. All right. What's the racial balance of the
4 population of the United States in terms of
5 Blacks and Whites?

6 A. For the entire country, I don't know.

7 Q. All right. What is the racial balance of the
8 Texas Medicaid population?

9 A. Large numbers of Hispanics and Blacks and with
10 a less number of Whites --

11 Q. Is it similar --

12 A. -- is my understanding.

13 Q. -- similar to the racial population of the
14 United States as a whole?

15 A. I doubt it, because Texas has more Spanish
16 than some parts of the United States as a
17 whole, the proportion.

18 Q. What's the incidence of cocaine use among the
19 population of the United States as a whole?

20 A. Don't know.

21 Q. Do you know how that compares to the incidence
22 of cocaine use among constituents in the Texas
23 Medicaid population?

24 A. Not having studied cocaine, I don't know.

25 Q. You have no suspicion whether it would be

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 higher or lower?

2 A. Don't know.

3 Q. Is marijuana use associated with adverse
4 pregnancy outcome?

5 A. Don't know.

6 Q. Do you know what the incidence of births to
7 unmarried mothers is among the United States
8 population as a whole?

9 A. I haven't looked that up recently.

10 Q. All right. Do you know how it may or may not
11 compare with the incidence of births to
12 unmarried mothers in the Texas Medicaid
13 population?

14 A. I have no data to give you an answer one way
15 or the other.

16 Q. Do you know what the incidence of substance or
17 alcohol abuse is among mothers in the
18 general -- pregnant mothers in the general
19 United States population?

20 A. No.

21 Q. Do you know how that may compare to the
22 incidence of substance or alcohol abuse in
23 the -- among mothers in the Texas Medicaid
24 population?

25 A. No.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Do you know what the concept of external
2 validity is in epidemiology?

5 Q. Do you know the criteria by which
6 epidemiologists judge the generalizability of
7 findings from one population to another?

8 A. As I've already stated, I'm not an
9 epidemiologist nor am I a statistician and I
10 do not know the inner workings of either
11 group.

12 Q. And I'm going to ask this rapidly because I
13 think it does cover some ground that we've
14 already covered, but I want to make sure
15 it's -- it has been done.

16 Dr. Speers, as I understand it,
17 you've made no analysis of the Florida
18 Medicaid population or any attempt to compare
19 it to any other population with respect to any
20 factor correct?

21 A. First, I'm a singular person; no "S" on the
22 end of my name.

23 Q. I'm sorry.

24 A. And you're correct in your assumption.

25 0. And that would include income, age, housing

1 conditions, race, ethnicity, education level,
2 drug use, access to medical care, use of
3 medical care, quality of care, diet,
4 nutrition, type of work performed outside the
5 home, any obstetric history or obstetric risk
6 factors?

7 A. I have done no investigation that would
8 address any of those issues.

9 Q. And you've not analyzed the incidence or
10 prevalence of smoking among pregnant mothers
11 in the Texas Medicaid population?

12 A. No. That's not my job nor my field of
13 endeavor.

14 Q. Nor have you analyzed the incidence of adverse
15 pregnancy outcomes in the Texas Medicaid
16 population?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. Nor have you analyzed the contribution
19 maternal smoking may or may not have had to
20 adverse pregnancy outcomes in the Texas
21 Medicaid population?

22 A. Correct.

23 Q. Nor have you analyzed the contribution of
24 other risk factors to any adverse pregnancy
25 outcomes in the Texas Medicaid population?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. Correct. As I stated earlier, I have done no
2 analyses on any population.

3 Q. Dr. Speer, you mentioned in your -- in
4 Exhibit 6 mental retardation. What study have
5 you done of mental retardation during your
6 career?

7 A. I have not done a study on mental retardation
8 in my career.

9 Q. All right. You haven't written on it or
10 lectured on it?

11 A. I've lectured on it insofar as it exists.
12 There are certain findings that are associated
13 with adverse intellectual outcome, if that's
14 what you mean.

15 Q. Lectures given to whom?

16 A. Medical students, residents, conferences.

17 Q. Describing what?

18 A. Well, for example, a ventricular hemorrhage
19 has an associated neurologic disability of X,
20 Y and Z. We know that certain categories of
21 prematures have a much higher incidence of
22 mental retardation than other categories of
23 prematures.

24 Q. All right. In certain portions of Exhibit 6,
25 you use the verb "caused." In certain

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 portions of Exhibit 6 you do not use the verb
2 "caused." And let's get an understanding.

3 Is it your opinion that maternal smoking
4 causes mental retardation?

5 A. A cause. It may be -- it looks like it may be
6 a very important cause, but it is a cause.

7 Q. All right. And is that based on one study
8 that you have reviewed?

9 A. There are a couple of studies.

10 Q. You've given us a copy of the Drews study
11 which was --

12 A. That's one of the most recent, correct.

13 Q. All right. What other studies are there?

14 A. I can't name them, but they are there.

15 Q. All right. Describe what you know about the
16 other studies that are there.

17 A. The conclusion is that smoking is associated
18 with mental retardation.

19 Q. All right. What group was studied -- is it
20 more than one other study or one other study?

21 A. It's my understanding there are more than one
22 other studies.

23 Q. Have you read them?

24 A. I have seen abstracts of them. I probably
25 have read a few of them over the years, yes.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. But as you sit here today, you can't give us
2 any more information about them than that?

3 A. Correct. I would refer you probably to the
4 reference list in the Drews article. That
5 would probably be a good starting place.

6 Q. All right. Did Drews -- did Drews mention
7 three studies which had failed to find an
8 association between maternal smoking and
9 mental retardation?

10 A. May I have Drews article?

11 Q. I believe it's behind you marked as an
12 exhibit.

13 A. And perhaps you would draw my attention to the
14 correct paragraph.

15 Q. I believe it's over on the first page in the
16 second column near the bottom where she
17 mentions three studies which have specifically
18 looked for an association between maternal
19 smoking and mental retardation.

20 A. Okay. There are three studies noted.

21 Q. All right. And does she -- does she say that
22 in each instance there, that the authors were
23 unable to find a statistically significant
24 difference of mental retardation in the
25 children of mothers who smoked?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. Given the definitions that are expressed, yes.

2 Q. All right. And so those three that she refers
3 to there are negative studies, correct?

4 A. In that they did not find an association with
5 what they defined as mental retardation,
6 correct.

7 Q. All right. And does she mention any study in
8 which it is alleged to have been found an
9 association -- a statistically significant
10 association between maternal smoking and
11 mental retardation?

12 A. She mentions 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, I think,
13 studies that are consistent which examine the
14 effect of smoking on cognitive function.

15 Q. Right. But those didn't examine the
16 relationship between smoking and mental
17 retardation, did they?

18 A. What is your definition of "mental
19 retardation"?

20 Q. Well, let's start with yours. How do you
21 define "mental retardation"?

22 A. Mental retardation is a diminished cognitive
23 function, to use this terminology.

24 Q. All right. And how is diminished cognitive
25 function -- how is cognitive function

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

11 Q. All right. The Minnesota Multiphasic
12 Personality Inventory, is that what you're
13 referring to?

14 A. That may be. It's not -- this is not my
15 field, so I don't know all of the various
16 tests that are currently available.

17 Q. What is -- psychometric testing is not your
18 field?

19 A. I'm a neonatologist, sir. I think we made
20 that clear earlier.

21 Q. Do you know -- are you -- do you consider
22 yourself an expert in psychometric testing?

23 A. №.

24 Q. All right. Do you know what the product of
25 psycho -- how the product of psychometric

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 testing is characterized?

2 A. I'm sorry?

3 Q. I'll start over.

4 A. Please.

5 Q. What is IQ?

6 A. Intellectual quotient.

7 Q. And how is that defined?

8 A. It's defined by a variety of standardized

9 tests that measure what is termed intellectual

10 quotient.

11 Q. Well, that's -- that's kind of a circular

12 response. What is an intellectual quotient?

13 What is the -- a quotient implies that one

14 number is being divided by another, correct?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Do you know what is being divided by what?

17 A. I am -- I don't do these types of -- I don't

18 study intellectual quotients.

19 Q. All right. Do you know what number is being

20 divided by what other number?

21 A. No.

22 Q. All right. Do you know what "G" is in

23 psychometric testing?

24 A. No.

25 Q. Do you know how well psychometric tests

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 measure true cognitive function?

2 A. How they measure true cognitive function?

3 Q. How well they are estimated to measure true

4 cognitive function.

5 A. I don't do these tests. I don't have any

6 knowledge on their development. I have no

7 knowledge on what validation criteria they

8 have met to be used. I would refer you to

9 someone who does.

10 Q. Have you read any of the negative studies that

11 Drews refers to there?

12 A. Well, her use of negative is on Page 1, as you

13 correctly pointed out. She then reviews the

14 three negative studies and has some criticism

15 of them. I have not personally reviewed any

16 of the three.

17 Q. All right. Have you reviewed Drews in terms

18 of the study methodology that was used?

19 A. In a -- I read this paper a number of months

20 ago when it first came out, which I believe

21 is -- what is the date? '96. I can't

22 remember when it was published. I apologize.

23 I read the paper when it first

24 was published. I have not reviewed it

25 in-depth since that point in time, but my

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 impression at that point in time was that it
2 was a quite exhaustive study and was
3 population based and had adequate numbers and
4 indeed would appear to be a fairly strong
5 statement, as a single statement.

6 Q. All right. Dr. Speer, what percentage of IQ
7 is considered to be heritable?

8 A. I don't know the exact percentage these days.
9 Certainly inheritance and genetics plays a
10 role in what you are given to start out with.

11 Q. Do you know what the -- do you know if there
12 have been studies that have investigated the
13 heritability of IQ, studies, for instance, of
14 monozygotic twins raised separately?

15 A. I believe there are such studies.

16 Q. All right. And they demonstrate, do they not,
17 that there is a substantial component of IQ
18 that's heritable, correct?

19 A. That's what I've said, yes.

20 Q. All right. And -- but in terms of telling us
21 approximately what percentage of IQ is
22 heritable, you're not prepared to say at this
23 point?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. All right. A baby inherits its IQ from -- a

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 part of its IQ from its mother and its father,
2 correct?

3 A. That is the conventional wisdom, correct.

4 Q. All right. That was not controlled for in
5 Carolyn Drews' study, was it, Doctor?

6 A. What the IQ of the parents were, is that what
7 your question is?

8 Q. Was IQ of either the mother or the father
9 controlled for in that study in terms of its
10 determinate of the IQ of the baby?

11 A. I don't believe they addressed that issue, but
12 the study is a population-based large study
13 and it probably is irrelevant.

14 Q. What is irrelevant?

15 A. Whether the IQ of the parents was in this
16 study.

17 Q. Well, we've established that IQ of the parent
18 is a strong determinate of the IQ of the baby,
19 correct?

20 A. As a statement, yes.

21 Q. All right. And Carolyn Drews, in her study,
22 did not control for maternal or paternal IQ,
23 did she?

24 A. She doesn't have to.

25 Q. Why doesn't she have to?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. Because she has a population-based study. A
2 population-based study, if it takes across all
3 the population, that variable disappears.
4 That's the beauty of a large population-based
5 study. That's why you don't do studies with a
6 single hospital or a single home for mental
7 retardation or what have you. You do a
8 population-based study.

9 Q. Okay. Let's say I designed a study like
10 this. All right. I took -- I took children
11 that I knew had mental retardation. All
12 right?

13 A. Okay.

14 Q. I'm going to need you to focus on this. All
15 right?

16 A. Okay. I am.

17 Q. And then I compared them to children who did
18 not have mental retardation, correct?

19 A. All right.

20 Q. You're with me so far?

21 A. I'm with you.

22 Q. All right. On that basis, based on what I
23 have done, I should assume that there's a
24 different parental level of IQ between the
25 parents -- between the parents of the retarded

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 children and the parents of the non-retarded
2 children, correct?

3 A. You're stating that --

4 Q. No, I'm designing a new study here.

5 A. Okay.

6 Q. All right. And what I've done is, I've taken
7 children who I know are retarded. All right?
8 And I've taken as my cases. And in my
9 comparison group, I have taken children who
10 are -- I know are not retarded. And I'm
11 talking about idiopathic mental
12 retardation -- all right -- for which there
13 is no explicable condition. All right?

14 A. Uh-huh.

15 Q. On that basis alone, statistically I know that
16 the IQ of the parents of the mentally retarded
17 children on a population basis will be
18 different from the IQ of the parents of the
19 non-retarded children, correct?

20 A. In the way you've designed your hypothetical
21 study, yes.

22 Q. All right.

23 A. But that's not how they designed this study.

24 Q. Is the quality of the home environment a
25 determinate of IQ in a child?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. It certainly may be a determinate.

2 Q. Is parenting style a determinate of the IQ of
3 a child?

4 A. How do you define "parenting style"?

5 Q. Well, let's start with an abusive or
6 neglectful home.

7 A. That may have an influence on the ultimate
8 intellectual and scholastic attainment of the
9 child, correct.

10 MR. MINTON: I'm sorry, did he say
11 intellectual and scholastic attainment?

12 THE COURT REPORTER: Yes.

13 THE WITNESS: You're not supposed
14 to nod. You're supposed to say "yes" or
15 "no."

16 THE COURT REPORTER: Thank you.

17 Q. (By Mr. Minton) Are smokers better or worse
18 maternal care-givers than nonsmokers?

19 A. Don't know.

20 Q. Has anyone, to your knowledge -- did Drews
21 suggest a hypothesis regarding any possible
22 mechanism for the mediation of a cognitive
23 effect for maternal cigarette smoking?

24 A. In a quick re-review of her article, I don't
25 believe that she proposes any data or

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 hypothesis on how.

2 Q. All right. You have forcefully told us that
3 you think alcohol use is the single most
4 important determinate of mental retardation in
5 children insofar as maternal exposure,
6 correct?

7 A. As I said, several authorities feel that that
8 is the single -- the most important cause for
9 mental retardation. It's not what I said.

10 Q. And do you think it is?

11 A. I think it is certainly a major cause of
12 mental retardation. I don't know if it's the
13 number one cause of mental retardation.

14 Q. And as I understand it, you said quite
15 forcefully that you did not think that race
16 had been associated with mental retardation?

17 A. Race by itself, and only by itself. I don't
18 believe that Black people are less intelligent
19 than any other race, nor do I feel that White
20 persons are less or more intelligent than any
21 other race, et cetera.

22 Q. Are Blacks at higher risk compared to Whites
23 for mental retardation?

24 A. If you're saying -- if you're asking that in a
25 population of Blacks is mental retardation

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

higher than a population of Whites of the same -- all other factors being controlled, including the incidence of low birth weight, small-for-dates babies, use of alcohol, tobacco and other products, I'm not too sure that that statement is a true one. But if you don't control for them, yes, it is a true statement.

9 Q. Okay. So in some crude odds ratio, in other
10 words some unadjusted odds ratio, you may
11 expect to see Black race emerging as a risk
12 factor for mental retardation, but once you
13 adjust or control for a variety of variables
14 that you just named, then that increased risk
15 disappears?

16 A. It may disappear. And again, I have not
17 studied this issue, I have not analyzed this
18 issue. I do not do research in this area.
19 I'm giving you an opinion based on what
20 reading I have done.

21 MR. BLEVINS: Doctor, what time
22 do you need to leave here in order to make
23 your 10:00 meeting?

24 THE WITNESS: About another 15
25 minutes. It's close.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 MR. MINTON: In about five I'm
2 going to be at a convenient point for a
3 break. But I don't -- you know, we can do
4 whatever.

5 Q. (By Mr. Minton) What are the risk factors for
6 mental retardation in children?

7 A. Goodness gracious. There may well be
8 literally hundreds of them. I don't purport
9 to be an expert on all, nor can I probably
10 name all of them.

11 Q. Is anemia?

12 A. Anemia, per se? Anemia, per se, may not be.
13 Iron deficiency anemia may be.

14 Q. Is toxemia?

15 A. Toxemia of whom?

16 Q. The mother.

17 A. Eclampsia?

18 Q. We'll get

19 without eclampsia?

22 smoking negatively associated with toxemia

25 mental retardation?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. Preeclampsia is toxemia. We've already
2 answered that. Eclampsia is a seizure during
3 the process worsening the preeclampsia.

4 Seizures in mothers are not good for babies.
5 So the answer would be yes.

6 Q. Is low weight gain in pregnancy a risk factor
7 for mental retardation?

8 A. I think we've addressed that issue before.

9 Q. Well, my recollection was that it was with
10 respect to other health end points.

11 A. You're asking specifically is poor weight gain
12 associated with mental retardation?

13 Q. Yes. Poor maternal weight gain during
14 pregnancy.

15 A. Depends on the cause of the poor maternal
16 weight gain.

17 Q. So it might be or it might not be?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. Is a maternal urinary tract infection in
20 pregnancy associated with mental retardation?

21 A. Don't think so.

22 Q. How about if it's a complication which is
23 linked to endotoxemia and fetal
24 leukoencephalopathy?

25 A. Well, then you're talking about more than just

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 a simple urinary tract infection, aren't you?

2 Q. If that's the case, is it then linked with
3 mental retardation?

4 A. If you're talking about a systemic infection
5 on the part of the mother that originated in
6 the urinary tract that results in the
7 production of endotoxins that can freely pass
8 in the fetal compartment, the answer is yes.

9 Q. All right. Is chorioamnionitis associated
10 with mental retardation?

11 A. There are some beginning data that suggests
12 that that's the case.

13 Q. Is male sex associated with mental
14 retardation?

15 A. I think in general boys are not quite as smart
16 as young ladies or older ladies.

17 Q. Does that mean yes?

18 A. I don't know whether it's mental retardation.

19 Q. Well, by the definition Drews uses, any -- any
20 risk factor that results in a shift of the
21 intelligence curve will be a risk factor for
22 mental retardation, won't it?

23 A. I don't remember reading that. It is entirely
24 possible boys have a higher incidence of
25 mental retardation because they have a higher

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 incidence of respiratory distress syndrome,
2 there are more of them that are premature, and
3 so certainly those survivors, because they are
4 premature, and prematures have a higher
5 incidence of mental retardation than term
6 babies, and there are more baby boys that are
7 premature than baby girls, then baby -- then
8 boys will have a higher incidence of mental
9 retardation. Whether that's based on the fact
10 that they are boys or not, I can't tell you.

11 Q. What's the mean birth weight differential
12 that's been ascribed to maternal cigarette
13 smoking?

14 A. You asked that and I couldn't tell you.
15 Remember?

16 Q. Do you know if it has been said to be of
17 clinical significance?

18 A. It appears to be of clinical significance
19 because a lot of people say it is, including
20 the Academy of Pediatrics.

21 Q. Is socioeconomic status a risk factor for
22 mental retardation?

23 A. It depends on what is the cause of the low
24 socioeconomic status.

25 Q. Well, if the -- if the socioeconomic status

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 that is measured is simply census tracked
2 income, is socioeconomic status associated
3 with mental retardation?

4 A. I stand by my previous answer.

5 Q. Well, I'm just interested if you know whether
6 or not studies say if we look at populations
7 and if we look at -- and compare them by
8 census track as a measure of socioeconomic
9 status, is socioeconomic status a risk factor
10 or predictor of mental retardation?

11 A. If you're only going to use that one single
12 rather crude indicator of mental retardation,
13 yes, there is an association between
14 socioeconomic status based on census trackers
15 income and mental retardation.

16 Q. All right. When we broke yesterday, we were
17 having a discussion about trying to predict
18 back and forward. And I think that you told
19 us twice yesterday that if we have an outcome
20 as to which there were multiple risk factors
21 present, that there is no way, looking
22 backward from the event, to say which risk
23 factors may have contributed in all or part to
24 the outcome, correct?

25 A. That wasn't the end of yesterday's

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 discussion. It was about halfway through
2 yesterday's discussion and again at the
3 beginning of today's discussion.

4 Q. All right.

5 A. But that's of no real mome.

6 Q. All right. But with those qualifiers -- I got
7 that part right. We're going to go on to the
8 next part.

9 A. I think you did.

10 Q. All right. The -- and what I understood you
11 to say, that going forward, it is your opinion
12 that the use of risk factors can tell you
13 something about predicting risk in an
14 individual. Did I get that right?

15 A. I think you did.

16 Q. All right. And that would be done
17 formalistically or in the medical -- in the
18 medical profession through the use of clinical
19 risk prediction scales, correct?

20 A. I don't know. Remember we talked about -- I
21 know you asked me about clinical risk
22 prediction scales used by obstetricians and I
23 told you that I was not familiar with those
24 and referred you to my obstetrical colleagues
25 for clarification.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. All right. Do you know, for instance, whether
2 there is any clinical risk prediction scale
3 for any of these adverse health outcomes that
4 says on the basis of maternal smoking alone,
5 that predicts an adverse pregnancy outcome on
6 the basis of maternal smoking alone?

7 A. Given that I just told you that I don't know
8 or don't -- and don't use any of those
9 clinical risk prediction scales that you have
10 mentioned, it would be absolutely impossible
11 for me to give you an answer to your follow-up
12 question.

13 Q. Would it also be impossible for you to say
14 what the predictive power of the combined risk
15 factors that we are aware of are? In other
16 words, if we use the existing knowledge about
17 what risk factors we have and try and predict
18 an event that's going to occur in the future,
19 how often we may correctly predict things?

20 A. I'm not even sure I know what you're talking
21 about, sir.

22 Q. Well, a clinical risk prediction scale is a
23 means by which we can take certain risk
24 factors --

25 A. Excuse me, if I may interrupt. I don't know

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 about clinical risk prediction scales. Any
2 discussion that you start or try to forward on
3 clinical risk prediction scales is
4 counterproductive, because I can't answer the
5 questions that you're posing.

6 Q. All right. So you would not know how
7 clinically we would take potential risks to an
8 unborn fetus and attempt to predict or project
9 those risks based on any existing criteria
10 that we have?

11 A. That's not what I said. I said I cannot
12 use -- I don't know anything about clinical
13 risk predictive scales. I do not know whether
14 those predictive scales do or do not take into
15 consideration smoking.

16 However, I can tell you that if
17 you take a population and you have a risk of
18 20 percent higher in a population who smokes
19 as opposed to a population who doesn't smoke,
20 or in the case of low birth weight that
21 appears it's 25 percent higher, then there is
22 a 25 percent higher risk in the populations
23 who smoke of low birth weight compared to the
24 population who doesn't. I can tell you that.

25 Q. All right. So it's your opinion that there is

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 an increased risk of 25 percent among mothers
2 who smoke, correct?

11 Q. All right. And that is the sole data that you
12 have in order to ballpark a risk of low birth
13 weight among mothers who smoke?

14 A. If you're talking about data as you have been
15 talking about it as opposed to how I've been
16 talking about it, correct.

17 Q. Well, I mean, yeah, data in terms of having a
18 hard number to provide us.

19 A. Correct.

20 MR. BLEVINS: Good time to
21 break?

22 MR. MINTON: That's fine.

23 MR. BLEVINS: Okay.

24 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is
25 9:58 a.m. We're going off the record.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 (Brief recess.)

2 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is
3 approximately 11:11 a.m. We're on the
4 record.

5 Q. (By Mr. Minton) Hi again, Dr. Speer.

6 A. Good morning.

7 Q. Dr. Speer, would it be correct to say that no
8 one knows by what mechanism smoking may
9 mediate the effect of prematurity?

10 A. I'm not too sure that no one knows, but I
11 don't know.

12 Q. All right. Have you seen any literature in
13 which an author has claimed that they had
14 identified to some degree of scientific
15 certainty that the mechanism of smoking
16 mediated prematurity was "X," whatever "X" may
17 be?

18 A. I'm unaware of any data.

19 Q. As I gathered from your testimony yesterday,
20 it is your impression from leading -- reading
21 the literature that the mechanism that you
22 have seen identified for maternal smoking
23 mediated low birth weight is nicotine?

24 A. That is one possible explanation, yes.

25 Q. All right. And is that a possibility that is

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 somewhere below the level of certainty in
2 terms of your opinion regarding what the
3 mechanism of maternal smoking mediated low
4 birth weight may be?

5 A. Given the number of chemicals that have here
6 to date been identified within tobacco, it
7 wouldn't surprise me that it's a
8 multifactorial issue as opposed to a single
9 agent.

10 Q. All right. Would it be fair to say, then,
11 that you're not giving an opinion to a
12 reasonable degree of scientific certainty that
13 nicotine is the mechanism by which maternal
14 smoking produces low birth weight?

15 A. I'm giving the opinion that nicotine may well
16 not be the only cause. It may be a
17 contributing cause, but I don't believe it's
18 probably the only cause.

19 Q. All right. Are you saying to a reasonable
20 degree of medical certainty that it is a
21 constituent cause of the mechanism by which
22 maternal smoking mediates a low birth weight
23 effect?

24 A. The information to date would suggest that it
25 is a cause.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. That it is a mechanism?

2 A. It is a part of the total cause.

3 Q. What are the risk factors that you've seen

4 identified for Sudden Infant Death Syndrome?

5 A. I think I've noted already that race does

6 appear to have an independent effect on Sudden

7 Infant Death Syndrome. Tobacco appears to

8 increase Sudden Infant Death Syndrome risk

9 fourfold over baseline, no matter what race is

10 involved. Position of the infant appears to

11 play a role in the incidence of Sudden Infant

12 Death Syndrome.

13 Q. Sleeping position?

14 A. Sleeping position. Soft bed materials have

15 been implicated in some studies and not in

16 others as a risk in Sudden Infant Death

17 Syndrome. CO₂ responsiveness appears to be a

18 risk factor in certain infants with immature

19 respiratory centers. And there are

20 undoubtedly others.

21 Q. What does CO₂ responsiveness mean?

22 A. That means the ability to initiate breath on

23 the -- with increasing CO₂ in the bloodstream.

24 Q. Has body temperature been associated with

25 SIDS?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. I'm not too sure body temperature has. There
2 has been at least one or two studies that I'm
3 aware of that relates to environmental
4 temperature.

5 Q. And do they show an increased risk if the
6 environmental temperature is kept low?

7 A. No, increased risk if environmental
8 temperature is kept high, if I remember
9 correctly.

10 Q. Is -- have there been studies which have
11 looked at breast and bottle feeding in terms
12 of the risk of SIDS?

13 A. Probably. I'm not directly familiar with
14 those studies.

15 Q. All right. Now, you've given us in your
16 opinion document and also orally here today a
17 relative risk of four. Do you know what study
18 that came from?

19 A. No, I do not.

20 Q. Do you know if there is more than one study
21 that reports a relative risk of four?

22 A. I don't know if there are more than one study
23 or not. I think that there are, but I can't
24 assure you absolutely.

25 Q. Do you -- do you know -- you don't know where

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 that four came from?

2 A. Not off the top of my head, no.

3 Q. It was just a number that occurred to you as

4 you were writing that document?

5 A. As I wrote the document.

6 Q. You didn't consult some other document, then?

7 A. Not at that time, no.

8 Q. All right. Nor since?

9 A. No.

10 Q. All right. Is there any known causal

11 mechanism for SIDS?

12 A. Well, one cause, as I implied, may be the

13 responsiveness of the respiratory center to

14 increasing CO₂. That appears to be a thread

15 that weaves throughout many of the proposed or

16 the -- not proposed but the observed increased

17 incidence. That -- that certainly is one of

18 the proposed mechanisms in regard to cigarette

19 smoke. It appears to be a proposed mechanism

20 for the position findings and the soft bedding

21 findings.

22 Q. And when you -- is your opinion referring to a

23 risk among children whose mothers smoked while

24 they were pregnant with those children?

25 A. Correct.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. All right. And it doesn't have anything to do
2 with environmental tobacco smoke exposure?

3 A. It may be additional -- environmental smoke
4 may play an additional role.

5 Q. Have you studied the literature on
6 environmental tobacco exposure?

7 A. I have not studied the literature.

8 Q. All right. And so do you have any opinion on
9 the relationship, if any, between ETS and
10 SIDS?

11 A. Who?

12 Q. Do you have an opinion on the relationship, if
13 any, between environmental tobacco smoke
14 exposure and SIDS?

15 A. I have -- I think that it's been shown that
16 environmental tobacco smoke may well have a
17 relationship to SIDS. I'm not certain as to
18 the exact weight of that environmental tobacco
19 smoke.

20 Q. All right. Do you know whether there was
21 quantitative exposure data in the study that
22 you're relying on for the 4.0 relative risk
23 regarding maternal cigarette smoke?

24 A. I do not remember.

25 Q. Is there any consistent pathology found in

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 infants who have died of SIDS?

2 A. More a lack of pathology than a positive
3 pathology.

4 Q. Other physicians -- and I -- this is perhaps
5 too much slang for you to tolerate at this
6 point, but other physicians have referred to
7 SIDS as a trash can diagnosis in the sense
8 that it is a diagnosis of exclusion where
9 there is -- there are no other explanatory
10 findings. Do you agree with that?

11 A. I prefer the term "diagnosis of exclusion."

12 Q. All right. And a diagnosis of exclusion means
13 we don't have any readily apparent cause to
14 blame a particular child's death on; is that
15 correct?

16 A. That we presently can identify.

17 Q. All right. And that's how a SIDS diagnosis is
18 made?

19 A. It's a -- it is a diagnosis of exclusion at
20 this point in time.

21 Q. All right. Would it be fair to say that there
22 is an awful lot that's unknown about the
23 occurrence of SIDS?

24 A. I think you could say that.

25 Q. All right. And would you be able to ballpark

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 in terms of the cause of SIDS, you know, the
2 percentage of what we know versus the
3 percentage of what we don't know?

4 A. Not knowing the totality of what we don't
5 know, no.

6 Q. Okay. Have there been negative studies
7 reported with respect to maternal smoking
8 status and SIDS in offspring?

9 A. I would anticipate there are.

10 Q. All right. Do you have any idea of studies
11 other than the one study that you've cited,
12 what the relative risk has been in those other
13 studies where a statistically significant
14 association has been found?

15 A. As I've stated, I have not done any literature
16 searches in this area.

17 Q. Doctor, what behavioral problems are you
18 referring to in your disclosure statements
19 that have raised concern over
20 neuro-developmental disorders?

21 A. It's my understanding that they fall into
22 school behavioral problems, attention deficit
23 and societal behavior problems. And the
24 association in this area is certainly loose.

25 Q. Does "loose" mean scientifically unproven, as

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 far as you're concerned?

2 A. As I noted in my document, studies have shown
3 behavioral problems in children of mothers who
4 smoke raising concern. And it's raised
5 concern. And that's where the level sits at
6 this point in time.

7 Q. It's below a scientific demonstration of cause
8 and effect, in your opinion?

9 A. At this point in time, it is probably less
10 than more likely than not.

11 Q. Would it be fair to say that you've not made
12 any methodologic analysis of those studies?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. And does the same hold true for the SIDS
15 studies as well?

16 A. I already stated that.

17 Q. All right. Is tocolytic therapy used in any
18 of the hospitals that you're on staff of to
19 prevent preterm delivery?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And has there been substantial success using
22 tocolytic therapy in terms of preventing
23 preterm delivery?

24 A. What do you mean by "substantial success"?

25 Q. It -- you raise a good point. What has been

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 the improvement in the delay of delivery or
2 enhancement of gestational age in mothers in
3 whom tocolytic therapy has been provided?

4 A. It really depends on the practitioner and
5 aggressiveness of tocolytic therapy and the
6 status of the mother's labor when she presents
7 herself for possible tocolytic therapy.

8 Q. All right. And I take it from -- that from
9 that response, that the -- the intervention
10 can result in zero improvement to substantial
11 improvement?

12 A. Correct.

13 Q. All right. And is there some mean or medium
14 level of improvement that you're comfortable
15 in describing?

16 A. No. I would refer you to an obstetrician to
17 be able to discuss obstetrical issues.

18 Q. All right. And I'm going to lump the next
19 four categories together, because I have a
20 feeling we may get the same type of response,
21 but are frequent provider contact, continuity
22 of provider, physical examination and patient
23 education by providers important criteria in
24 terms of preventing premature birth?

25 A. That's a rather broad statement. Would you

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 mind enumerating the four again?

2 Q. Frequent provider contact, continuity of
3 provider, physical examinations and patient
4 education by providers.

5 A. Certainly the last is very important.

6 Q. Patient education?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. All right. How about physical examinations?

9 A. Depends on what the physical examination would
10 entail, obviously. And so depending on the
11 physical exam, it might be anywhere from very
12 important to relatively important.

13 Q. Is continuity of provider important in terms
14 of preventing premature delivery?

15 A. People -- I'm quoting obstetrical literature.
16 Once again I refer you to an obstetrician for
17 a better opinion. But if my knowledge of
18 obstetrical literature is current, it is less
19 so than people had hoped. It is important,
20 but less so than people had hoped.

21 Q. Do any of the hospitals with which you're
22 associated provide intrauterine monitoring as
23 a means of forestalling premature delivery?

24 A. Exactly what do you mean by "intrauterine
25 monitoring"?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Are there intrauterine monitors that can give
2 a woman some sense of whether labor is
3 beginning to occur?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. All right. And are those intrauterine
6 monitors sometimes used to alert women to the
7 possible signs of labor in an effort to
8 prevent full-blown or full-fledged labor from
9 occurring?

10 A. Not intrauterine monitors, no.

11 Q. Extrauterine monitors?

12 A. Extrauterine monitors.

13 Q. I used the wrong word. Are extrauterine
14 monitors, then, used by the hospitals with
15 which you're affiliated to assist in the
16 prevention of premature delivery?

17 A. As a broad general statement, I think that
18 would be true.

19 Q. All right. And is it your impression that
20 again with respect to tocolytic treatment,
21 that there is a range of outcome that one
22 might expect from that intervention from no
23 improvement to significant improvement?

24 A. Extrauterine monitoring is not an
25 intervention. Tocolysis is.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. All right. Well, the use of that -- is it --
2 would you call it a treatment modality? What
3 would you call it?

4 A. Diagnostic.

5 Q. All right. With the use of that diagnostic
6 tool, has there been some data developed that
7 show that that can reduce the occurrence of
8 premature delivery?

9 A. Only if it's coupled with tocolysis, effective
10 tocolysis.

11 Q. Dr. Speer, is there a benchmark figure which
12 you have seen mentioned in the literature
13 which respect to either low birth weight or
14 prematurity that pertains to the author's
15 conclusions that low birth weight and/or
16 prematurity is associated with maternal
17 smoking, in other words, an amount of smoking
18 that is often referred to as the amount of
19 smoking which produced the relationship or the
20 statistical data that is set forth in the
21 paper?

22 A. Could you simplify that question?

23 Q. Yeah. Is -- do -- do studies of maternal
24 smoking which report relative risks for low
25 birth weight or prematurity generally look at

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 that risk in women who smoke a pack a day or
2 more?

3 A. I don't know the exact -- each study is
4 somewhat different in the amount of smoking
5 that has been studied. There does appear to
6 be in some studies a relationship between the
7 amount of smoking and the timing of smoking
8 and subsequent outcome, as I summarized in my
9 statement that I provided.

10 Q. All right. And in terms of the amount of
11 smoking, if smoking is an -- is exerting an
12 adverse pregnancy outcome, we would expect it
13 to do so in accordance with the dose response
14 principle, correct?

15 A. Depending upon the outcome would depend on
16 whether that statement would be true.

17 Q. Can you think of any outcome that would be
18 quote/unquote exempt from the operation of the
19 dose response principle?

20 A. Not knowing everything about how tobacco works
21 in causing these effects, it is difficult to
22 formulate an answer to your question.

23 However, it is well-known that in other
24 models, you don't have to give very much of a
25 substance to achieve an effect.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

6 In other instances such as the
7 closure of a patent ductus arteriosus with
8 indomethacin, we have a dose response curve
9 and it is related to numbers of doses and the
10 ultimate level of the drug achieved in the
11 bloodstream. Both of those are valid
12 operational mechanisms for the effect of drugs
13 on the human subject.

14 So in some instances, it appears
15 that it is a dose response that maternal
16 tobacco smoking confers on the fetus. In
17 other instances, although I cannot point to
18 them directly, it may well be a single
19 exposure. I cannot say that that cannot
20 occur.

21 Q. Well, it seems to me what you're
22 differentiating are acute exposures and
23 chronic exposures, correct?

24 A. Basically.

25 Q. All right. And for an acute or a chronic

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 exposure, the dose response principle would
2 apply, correct?

3 A. Sometimes it takes less doses and sometimes it
4 takes more doses.

5 Q. Right. Depending upon what we're talking
6 about, is an acutely or a chronically mediated
7 effect, correct?

8 A. Not totally.

9 Q. Are any of the effects that you are referring
10 to in Exhibit 6 the result of non-chronic
11 exposures?

12 A. Okay. In a hypothetical infant who already
13 has uterine placental insufficiency who's
14 exposed to a very high level of nicotine,
15 there would be an acute single vaso -- could
16 be an acute single vasoconstrictive event that
17 would compromise a variety of organ systems,
18 one of which could be the brain. Doesn't
19 necessarily have to be a chronic exposure
20 model in that sense.

21 Q. Do you have any idea what the circulating
22 nicotine level would have to be in a fetus in
23 order to affect the blood supply to the fetal
24 brain?

25 A. It would undoubtedly depend on the

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 circumstances of the fetus. And, no, I do not
2 know the exact bloodstream level that would
3 have to be operational.

4 Q. Well, can you give us -- you qualified that by
5 giving the qualifier "exact." Do you have any
6 idea what the circulating level of nicotine
7 would have to be in order to produce the
8 effect that you've postulated?

9 A. No, I do not; which you didn't ask that
10 originally.

11 Q. While we're on the subject of nicotine,
12 briefly, are you familiar with the Doppler
13 studies in human pregnancies that have looked
14 at the effect of fetoplacental and
15 uteroplacental circulation?

16 A. Only in a very general fashion. Once again, I
17 would refer you to my obstetrical colleagues.
18 I do not practice obstetrics.

19 Q. Do you know whether or not nicotine increases
20 or decreases resistance in the fetoplacental
21 circulation?

22 A. Not knowing exactly where in the fetoplacental
23 circulation those studies addressed and not
24 being familiar with the Doppler studies done
25 in pregnant mothers and further not having

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 done those studies, I cannot answer your
2 question.

3 Q. All right. How about in the uteroplacental
4 vessels, do you know if nicotine increases or
5 reduces resistance in the uteroplacental
6 vessels?

7 A. If it causes vasoconstriction, it would cause
8 increased resistance to flow. And if you're
9 talking about the uterine artery, it is my
10 understanding that nicotine does constrict
11 flow.

12 Q. So a finding of reduced resistance in the
13 uteroplacental vessels would be inconsistent
14 with that, wouldn't it?

15 A. Would be inconsistent?

16 Q. Yes.

17 A. If you're -- remember, I'm talking about the
18 uterine artery; you're talking about a whole
19 blood circulating system when you say "uterine
20 placental flow."

21 Q. Would those two things be consistent or
22 inconsistent?

23 A. The way that we've defined them, inconsistent,
24 because you're talking about a generality and
25 I'm talking about a specific.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. The -- what is the -- what is the median
2 weight of a baby at the beginning of the
3 seventh month of pregnancy?

4 A. Are you defining --

5 Q. Excuse me, the end of the -- the end of the
6 sixth month.

7 A. Are you talking about a 24-week fetus?

8 Q. Is that the median gestational age for a --

9 A. I go on weeks of gestation. I don't go on
10 months. So I'm trying to find out what you're
11 trying to ask me.

12 Q. Okay. Twenty-four weeks.

13 A. Twenty-four weeks? Again, I'd have to go back
14 to the curves to give you a precise number,
15 but probably about between 600 and 650 grams,
16 right around there.

17 Q. Okay. And are you aware of any studies that
18 have looked at the weight of 24-week-old
19 fetuses in mothers who smoke versus mothers
20 who don't smoke, in other words, what the
21 weight difference is at that point of
22 gestation?

23 A. I am unaware of any studies that have looked
24 specifically at that particular gestation.

25 However, I would anticipate that there is very

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 little, if any, fetal weight difference in
2 those two.

3 Q. You would expect that difference to be
4 exceedingly small, wouldn't you?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. All right. And is that because most of fetal
7 growth occurs in the seventh, eighth and ninth
8 months?

9 A. Depends on your definition of "fetal growth."
10 If you're talking about weight in grams, the
11 answer is yes. If you're talking about cell
12 multiplication, the answer is no.

13 Q. All right. Let's -- let's phrase it in terms
14 of weight in grams.

15 A. Okay.

16 Q. All right. Does then the majority or the bulk
17 of growth occur in the seventh, eighth and
18 ninth months?

19 A. The daily increment of weight is higher in the
20 end of pregnancy in actual grams than in the
21 beginning of pregnancy. The ratio of growth
22 weight to body weight may be equivalent.

23 Q. Well, for instance, in the first two
24 trimesters, the fetus has grown to
25 approximately 650 or so grams, correct?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. Correct.

2 Q. And in the -- in the last trimester, the fetus
3 is going to, in terms of median birth weight,
4 grow an additional about 2,800 grams?

5 A. My point is, that 600-gram'er may well gain
6 six grams to ten grams of weight a day whereas
7 a 2,500-gram baby may grow 25 to 35 grams a
8 day. So the amount of weight is
9 proportional -- weight gain is proportional to
10 the body weight.

11 Q. I see the point you're making.

12 A. And that stays relatively the same.

13 Q. I understand the point you're making. I'm
14 asking about a slightly different one. Just
15 in terms of the overall weight gain in the
16 third trimester, would the mean overall weight
17 gain be in the neighborhood of 2,850 grams? I
18 mean, if we assumed is a -- does a mean weight
19 of 3,500 grams sound about right to you?

20 A. 3,000 to 3,500.

21 Q. All right. And so we should subtract the 650
22 from that to determine the amount of weight
23 gain that occurred in the third trimester?

24 A. Total amount of weight gained is larger in the
25 last trimester than it is in the first

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 trimester --

2 Q. All right.

3 A. -- if you're just weighing in grams.

4 Q. All right. From the physiologic standpoint,
5 would that not tell us that if smoking is
6 going -- maternal smoking is going to mediate
7 a significant -- or a change in birth weight,
8 that the vast majority of that change is going
9 to occur in the third trimester?

10 A. That seems to be the experience, correct.

11 Q. All right. And so would it be fair to say
12 that if a woman quits smoking before the third
13 trimester, the chances are, in terms of
14 inter -- or low birth weight, the chances are
15 that the birth weight of her baby is going to
16 be essentially equivalent to that of a
17 nonsmoker?

18 A. I'm not too sure it's the third trimester, but
19 certainly if she stops somewhere after the
20 first and the middle of the second, one would
21 anticipate that that weight effect would
22 disappear. And studies seem to have concluded
23 that that is the case.

24 Q. All right. And do the studies also seem to
25 indicate that with respect to any of the

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 health effects which you've testified about or
2 that are in Exhibit 6, that if a woman quits
3 her smoking by either the middle of the second
4 trimester or the beginning of the third
5 trimester, that she can reduce her risk to
6 that of a nonsmoker?

7 A. She can reduce her risks in many areas. I
8 think it will -- will have to be studied in
9 further detail as to whether or not stopping
10 smoking in the second trimester has an
11 influence on the issue of mental retardation,
12 because as I pointed out, cell division is the
13 key during the first two trimesters of
14 pregnancy. And the effect of tobacco may
15 indeed be injurious to cell division and
16 appropriate differentiation. And that may
17 occur in the first trimester. At present, I
18 don't think there is any data to say either
19 way whether that is the case, but that
20 certainly should be a concern.

21 Q. Putting mental retardation outside, then, of
22 the ambit of the former question, would that
23 be a true statement?

24 A. I think based on the knowledge we have at
25 present, if the mother stops smoking in the

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 first trimester, early second trimester, many
2 of the issues that you would -- inquired of me
3 today would be ameliorated.

4 Q. And with respect to chronic exposures or any
5 effects that are mediated through chronic
6 exposures, would it be fair to say that the
7 dose response principle applies?

8 A. Up to a degree. There is recent data in
9 adults that I recently read that there
10 appears -- this is a single study, certainly
11 is not proving -- but there may well be a
12 genetic trigger that is switched on after a
13 certain amount of exposure to tobacco that
14 even if the individual stops smoking, they are
15 at significant increased risk to develop lung
16 cancer at a later date because of the genetic
17 switch. That type of phenomenon may also
18 occur in babies. We don't know.

19 Q. That's pure speculation at this point?

20 A. That's speculation in babies. It looks like
21 there is certainly something going on in
22 adults. Being how babies are replicating
23 themselves at a much faster and higher rate
24 and in a more complex manner than adults, I
25 would be concerned.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. All right. But putting speculative issues
2 aside, in terms of what we know, would it be
3 fair to say that the chronic effects about
4 which we know seem to behave in accordance
5 with the dose response principle?

6 A. In many respects, yes.

7 Q. All right. And --

8 A. Oh, I remembered the name. Joel Dunnington.
9 Joel Dunnington is the radiologist that asked
10 me whether or not I would serve as an expert.

11 Q. All right. Do you know who --

12 A. I told you I would remember.

13 Q. Yeah. Do you know who -- do you know who
14 Dr. Dunnington is?

15 A. As I said yesterday, I believe he's a
16 radiologist at the M.D. Anderson Cancer
17 Institute.

18 Q. Do you know anything else about him?

19 A. He's on the Harris County Medical Society
20 Delegation to the Texas Medical Association.

21 Q. Do you have any --

22 A. He's an adult. He's overweight. He has a hip
23 problem --

24 Q. Is --

25 A. -- or back, one or the other.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. Do you have any personal or professional
2 relationship with him?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Do you know what Doctors Ought To Care is?
5 Have you ever heard --

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. -- of that organization? Are you a member of
8 it?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Do you know what it is?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. What is it?

13 A. It's an organization founded by a physician
14 named Alan Blum who is a family practitioner
15 who in the group feels very strongly that
16 tobacco is an undesirable product and uses
17 what they term humor, although the tobacco
18 industry doesn't appear to look at it as
19 humor, to denigrate the product.

20 Q. What else do you know about Doctors Ought To
21 Care, anything?

22 A. That's about it.

23 Q. All right. Do you know if Dr. Dunnington is
24 the head of Doctors Ought To Care or is
25 affiliated with it?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. It wouldn't surprise me if Dr. Dunnington was
2 a member, but I don't know for a fact.

3 Q. Has he made his anti-tobacco feelings clear to
4 you?

5 A. He has been a relentless crusader against
6 tobacco, one could phrase that probably
7 correctly.

8 Q. All right. Have you ever read any of
9 Dr. Dunnington's publications?

10 A. No.

11 Q. Do you know of any of his publications?

12 A. I would anticipate he is published, given the
13 environment in which he practices.

14 Q. Did Dr. Dunnington tell you that he was going
15 to be a witness in this case?

16 A. I have no earthly idea whether he's a witness
17 or not.

18 Q. Have you ever heard Dr. Dunnington speak?

19 A. On what subject?

20 Q. Tobacco.

21 A. I've heard him say, you know, in various
22 forums that -- you know, particularly in the
23 TMA forum, that the TMA ought to come out very
24 strongly against sales of tobacco to minors
25 and also to regulate -- not -- "regulate" is

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 too strong a word -- to encourage strongly
2 that tobacco smoking be eliminated within the
3 TMA meetings. That was a number of years ago,
4 and it has. And also coming out strongly that
5 smoking in public places ought to be
6 eliminated as a posture of the TMA. And I
7 believe that is indeed TMA's posture.

8 MR. BLEVINS: Doctor, what time
9 do you need to leave to get to your 12:00
10 o'clock?

11 THE WITNESS: We're fine.

12 MR. MINTON: I'm sorry?

13 THE WITNESS: Right around
14 12:00. And you can lock this room, if you
15 wish.

16 MR. MINTON: Okay. There is a
17 real possibility, I think, that we could
18 finish up. I don't know what latitude you
19 have in terms of being a few minutes late
20 or something.

21 THE WITNESS: The latitude is a
22 few minutes.

23 MR. MINTON: Okay.

24 THE WITNESS: Defined as less
25 than five.

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 Q. (By Mr. Minton) Doctor, do you have children?

2 A. Two.

3 Q. How old are they?

4 A. Twenty-three and seventeen.

5 Q. Do either smoke?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Did you have a rule against smoking in your
8 house?

9 A. No. They were the ones that in large measure
10 were responsible, along with my wife, for my
11 stopping.

12 Q. Have you -- have you familiarized yourself
13 with any statistics regarding what percentage
14 of women stop smoking when they learn they
15 have become pregnant?

16 A. I can't give you an exact number. I know that
17 a large -- well, at least I know a number do.

18 Q. And you were about to say large number but you
19 caught yourself. It is a -- it is a number
20 that you consider something relatively
21 significant in terms of the clinical
22 experience that you've had?

23 A. Correct.

24 Q. And are there another group of women who after
25 first learning that they are pregnant quit

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 after their first prenatal visit because they
2 are counseled to do so by their physician?

3 A. I would anticipate that is a true statement.

4 Q. All right. And in terms of the number of
5 women who persist in smoking who don't
6 spontaneously quit when they first learn
7 they've become pregnant or quit as a result of
8 advice of counseling from a physician, do you
9 know what percentage of the women who were
10 initially smokers that is?

11 A. No.

12 Q. It is your clinical experience, though, that
13 there is a rather significant change in the --
14 in the percentage of women who smoke during
15 pregnancy as opposed to women who were simply
16 of child-bearing age?

17 A. I know that women who are smokers who become
18 pregnant, there is a certain percentage of
19 those women who will stop smoking either on
20 the basis of knowledge that they are pregnant
21 or upon counseling from the physician or other
22 healthcare provider.

23 Q. Would it be fair to say, then, that a -- an
24 estimate of women of child-bearing age would
25 not be a reasonable estimate of women who

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 continue to smoke while they are pregnant?

2 A. I'm sorry?

3 Q. Would it be fair to say, then, that an
4 estimate of the percentage of women of
5 child-bearing age who smoke would not be an
6 accurate estimate of the women who smoke while
7 they are pregnant?

8 A. I think you probably have to define your
9 population. Some populations will stop more
10 readily than other populations.

11 Q. All right. And what is the basis of that
12 belief?

13 A. As you pointed out, some people don't seek
14 medical care and they don't necessarily have
15 the educational background to understand the
16 potential hazards of smoking. And thus if
17 they don't have any knowledge, they have no
18 basis to stop.

19 Q. All right. If one were to use general
20 statistics, would the statement become -- you
21 know, nationwide statistics, would the
22 statement become a true one that the smoking
23 prevalence among women of child-bearing age is
24 not comparable to the smoking prevalence of
25 women who are actually pregnant?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. That may be. I don't know for a fact. I have
2 no experience in looking at those particular
3 data.

4 Q. Would it be fair to say that you don't have
5 any data on the percentage of women who
6 persist in smoking in pregnancy who are
7 unaware of risks to their unborn children?

8 A. Correct.

9 Q. Would it be fair to say that it has been the
10 mission of the -- of medical practitioners in
11 the state of Texas to communicate that message
12 to all women who are smokers and who are
13 pregnant?

14 A. It is my understanding that that is something
15 that the obstetrical community and other
16 physicians try -- attempt to do, yes.

17 Q. All right. Now, you mentioned -- there is a
18 reference in your disclosure document about
19 women starting smoking while they are
20 pregnant. Would it be fair to say that that's
21 an extremely rare phenomenon?

22 A. I doubt it.

23 Q. Do you know -- have you seen any statistics on
24 the number or percentage of women who begin to
25 smoke while they are pregnant?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. No. But if you're a teenager and that group
2 has an unfortunate -- depending on the group
3 you study, has an unfortunate ability to both
4 smoke and get pregnant.

5 Q. If smoking -- if the chronically mediated
6 effects of smoking adhere to the dose response
7 principle, it is fair to say that as to those
8 effects, there is a no-effect level, correct?

9 A. I followed your first phrase. I didn't get
10 the last part.

11 Q. Are you familiar with the term "no-effect
12 level"?

13 A. No.

14 Q. All right. I want you to assume that that
15 means a level or a dose at which no symptom of
16 any clinical significance is produced. Okay?

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. All right. If -- if the chronically mediated
19 effects that are attributed to maternal
20 smoking adhere to the dose response principle,
21 there will be for each of those a no-effect
22 level, correct?

23 A. You've made a rather large speculative leap of
24 faith.

25 Q. Why is that?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. It's an awfully big "if."
2 Q. What part of the "if"?
3 A. The whole part of the "if." You know,
4 you're -- you're taking a dose response effect
5 and then hypothesizing that in given
6 individuals the given effect may or may not
7 have no effect. And as I've already stated,
8 we don't know that for sure. If you'd just
9 stuck with the dose response, I would have
10 been more than happy to agree with you.

11 Q. All right. Is it your opinion that there is a
12 negative association between maternal smoking
13 and congenital abnormalities of the newborn?

14 A. I don't think that that's been shown, at least
15 shown in the totality of looking at the
16 products of conception in smoking mothers and
17 the incidence of chromosomal abnormalities
18 throughout the extent of pregnancy.

19 If abortions are higher in
20 mothers who smoke, which they appear to be,
21 the most primary cause of abortion in the
22 first trimester are chromosomal
23 abnormalities. So if the abortions are
24 higher, then you have a higher incidence of
25 chromosomal abnormalities. In the totality of

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 pregnancy, because you have deaths that
2 occurred during the pregnancy, you may have
3 less chromosomal abnormalities in the
4 surviving child.

5 Q. Do you know whether there has been --

6 A. So I don't know the information that you seek.

7 Q. All right. Is the first part of that
8 speculation on your part in the sense that
9 have you -- have you attempted to discern
10 whether there were studies which looked at
11 chromosomal abnormalities in abortuses to
12 determine whether or not they existed and then
13 correlated that with maternal smoking?

14 A. I'm not -- I don't have any information
15 regarding the correlation of maternal
16 smoking. However, I do -- am very aware that
17 most abortions during the first trimester are
18 the result of a variety of chromosomal
19 abnormalities, triploidy and diploidy being
20 two.

21 Q. All right. But whether -- whether abortions
22 that some studies have attempted to
23 statistically associate with maternal smoking,
24 spontaneous abortions fall within that group,
25 you don't know?

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. I don't know if the chromosomal analysis was
2 done on those abortuses.

3 Q. All right. Now, putting that issue aside, is
4 it fair to say that in terms of fetuses that
5 live and -- that there is a negative
6 association between maternal smoking and
7 chromosomal abnormalities?

8 A. I don't know.

9 Q. Is there any association that you've ever
10 heard of that's been linked between maternal
11 smoking and congenital pneumonia?

12 A. How do you define "congenital pneumonia"?

13 Q. Is that an ICD-9 diagnostic entry?

14 A. It may well be and it would cover a variety of
15 pathogens.

16 Q. All right. Have -- are you aware of any
17 studies that have purported to link maternal
18 smoking with congenital pneumonia?

19 A. Well, only by inference. And the inference is
20 that if you take a population of patients that
21 have premature or prolong rupture fetal
22 membranes, that population has an increased
23 risk of infection. One of the infectious
24 diagnoses would be congenital pneumonia.

25 Q. How about meconium aspiration, are you aware

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 of any studies that link maternal smoking --
2 A. I think probably there are, because meconium
3 passage in utero is related to fetuses who are
4 small -- small-for-dates and pregnancies that
5 have complications, particularly of the
6 uterine placental unit.

13 Q. Are you aware of any studies that looked into
14 the specific relationship between maternal
15 smoking and meconium aspiration?

16 A. I have not looked for them, but it would not
17 surprise me in the least that they exist.

18 Q. Okay. Well, regardless of whether it would
19 surprise you, as you sit here today, you don't
20 know whether they exist?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. Is there a clinical diagnosis of
23 large-for-date?

24 A. Sure.

25 Q. What is the birth weight --

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 A. Above the 90th percentile for gestational age.

2 Q. All right. Is that an adverse pregnancy
3 outcome?

4 A. Can be, depending on the circumstances.

5 Q. What are the complications that are associated
6 with that?

7 A. Depends on what it's due to. If it's due to
8 infants of diabetic mothers, then you have an
9 increased risk of hyaline membrane disease,
10 you have an increased risk of what's termed
11 birth trauma, because the baby is large and
12 may be difficult to deliver from the -- from
13 below via the vagina. They can have issues of
14 hypoglycemia and hypocalcemia. Those are the
15 primary problems of the infant of a diabetic
16 mother.

17 If they happen to have a total --
18 let's see, transposition of the great vessels,
19 those babies tend to be large. And obviously
20 transposition of the great vessels is a rather
21 serious congenital heart disease.

22 If they happen to have
23 Becklet-Weidman Syndrome (phonetic), then they
24 will have invalid seals and hypoglycemia and
25 have a risk of increased mental retardation as

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 they grow older. Whether that retardation is
2 due to the hypoglycemia or intrinsic to the
3 condition is unknown.

4 Those are the -- and then you can
5 have big babies because you have big parents,
6 and those kids usually do fine except for the
7 difficulty occasionally occasioned during the
8 vaginal birth.

9 Q. So there is -- just as there is in the
10 small-for-date classification, there -- in the
11 large-for-date classifications there is
12 large-normal and large-abnormal?

13 A. One could call it that.

14 Q. And in terms of the babies who are
15 large-abnormal, are there significant costs
16 that are associated with those adverse
17 pregnancy outcomes as well?

18 A. Can be. Usually not as significant as
19 prematures, but you certainly have costs
20 associated.

21 MR. MINTON: Thank you,
22 Dr. Speer.

23 THE WITNESS: You're welcome.

24 MR. BLEVINS: We'll reserve our
25 questions until time of trial

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is
2 12:06 p.m. We're off the record.

3 (Discussion off the record.)

4 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is
5 12:07. We're on the record.

6 MR. MINTON: We wanted to put one
7 more thing on the record, and that is the
8 court reporter is going to just make a log
9 of the depositions that were sent by
10 Mr. Blevins to Dr. Speer so that we will
11 have next to the deposition as Appendix "A"
12 a list of the depositions that were
13 provided to Dr. Speer so that we have a
14 complete record of what he had. Did I get
15 that right?

16 MR. BLEVINS: Yes.

17 THE WITNESS: Perhaps I should
18 suggest not only depositions but any
19 further documents that weren't entered as
20 exhibits

21 MR. MINTON: That are there on
22 the cart?

23 THE WITNESS: Right. I don't
24 know if -- I think they are all
25 depositions, but in case they weren't, :

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 you'd like those pieces of paper, you now
2 can have them.

3 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is
4 12:08. We're off the record.

5 (Discussion off the record.)

6 MR. BLEVINS: Parties have
7 reviewed the exhibits and find that
8 Exhibit 11 is missing from those that will
9 be attached to the deposition. Exhibit 11
10 was the drawing prepared by defense counsel
11 in the review of issues related to Whites
12 versus Blacks low birth weight babies, if I
13 recall.

14 MR. MINTON: It was, yeah,
15 distribution of birth weights. And it's
16 evidently missing in action.

17 MR. BLEVINS: And the parties
18 have agreed that the deposition may be
19 completed without the attachment of that
20 exhibit.

21 (Deposition concluded.)

22

23

24

25

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1

2 CHANGE-CORRECTION PAGE

3 Please indicate changes on this sheet of paper,
4 giving the page and line number, the change and the
5 reason for the changes. Reason for changes are: (1)
To clarify the record; (2) To conform to the facts;
(3) To correct transcript errors.

6 PAGE LINE CORRECTION REASON

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1 SIGNATURE OF WITNESS

2
3 I have read the foregoing transcript of my
4 deposition taken on the 4th day of September, 1997,
5 and it is a true and accurate record of my testimony
6 given at that time and place, except as to any
7 corrections I have listed on the errata sheet(s).

8
9
10
11
12 MICHAEL SPEER, M.D.
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

THE STATE OF TEXAS)

SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO BEFORE ME, the
undersigned authority, on this the _____ day of
_____, 1997.

NOTARY PUBLIC IN AND FOR
THE STATE OF TEXAS

MY COMMISSION EXPIRES:

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
TEXARKANA DIVISION

3

4 THE STATE OF TEXAS :
5 Plaintiff :
6 VS. :
7 THE AMERICAN TOBACCO COMPANY; : CIVIL ACTION
R.J. REYNOLDS TOBACCO COMPANY; : NO. 5-96CV91
8 BROWN & WILLIAMSON TOBACCO :
CORPORATION; B.A.T. INDUSTRIES, : UNITED STATES JUDGE:
9 P.L.C.; PHILIP MORRIS, INC.; LIGGETT: DAVID FOLSOM
GROUP, INC.; LORILLARD TOBACCO :
10 COMPANY, INC.; UNITED STATES :
TOBACCO COMPANY; HILL & : UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE:
11 KNOWLTON, INC.; THE COUNCIL : WENDELL C. RADFORD
FOR TOBACCO RESEARCH-USA, INC. :
12 (Successor to Tobacco Institute :
Research Committee); and THE TOBACCO :
13 INSTITUTE, INC. :
14

15 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION
16 ORAL DEPOSITION OF MICHAEL SPEER
17 TAKEN SEPTEMBER 4, 1997

17

I, Linda Tate, Certified Shorthand Reporter in and
for the State of Texas, hereby certify that this
deposition transcript is a true record of the
testimony given by the witness named herein, after
said witness was duly sworn by me.

20

I further certify that I am neither attorney nor
counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the
parties to the action in which this testimony was
taken. Further, I am not a relative nor employee of
any attorney of record in this cause, nor do I have a
financial interest in this action.

24

25

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1

2 Subscribed and sworn to on this the _____ day of
3 _____, 1997.

4

5

Linda Tate, CSR
CSR Certification No: 2965
Expiration Date: 12-31-97

6

7 SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO
8 1630 Two Houston Center
9 Houston, Texas 77010
10 (713) 650-1800

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800

1

APPENDIX "A"

2

- 3) Transmittal letter dated August 8, 1997,
transmitting the depositions and exhibits
of Dr. Robert C. Woody, Dr. Robert
Arrington, Dr. Robert J. Carpenter and
Dr. Percy Luecke, Jr.
- 5) Deposition of Dr. Robert J. Carpenter,
Pages 1 through 156, with index and
condensed transcript and Exhibits 1
through 4 to Dr. Carpenter's deposition.
- 8) Deposition of Dr. Robert Arrington,
Pages 1 through 172, with index and
condensed transcript and Exhibits 1 and 2
to Dr. Robert Arrington's deposition.
- 10) Deposition of Dr. Percy E. Luecke,
Pages 1 through 153, including index and
condensed transcript and Exhibit No. 1 to
Dr. Luecke's deposition.
- 13) Deposition of Dr. Robert C. Woody,
Pages 1 through 178, including index and
condensed transcript and Exhibits 1, 2
and 3 to Dr. Woody's deposition.
- 15) Transmittal letter dated August 17, 1997,
enclosing the deposition of Dr. Benjamin
Sachs.
- 17) Condensed Deposition of Dr. Benjamin
Sachs taken in the Mississippi case,
Pages 1 through 262.
- 19) Condensed deposition of Benjamin T. Sachs
in the State of Florida versus American
Tobacco Company case.
- 21) Condensed deposition of Dr. Jeane Ann
McCarthy in the State of Florida versus
American Tobacco.
- 23) Condensed version of the Robert Carpenter
deposition in the Texas case.

25

SOUTHWEST REPORTING & VIDEO SERVICE, INC.
(713) 650-1800